



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3706

Title: epidemiology of esophageal cancer

Reviewer code: 00477066

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-05-16 15:28

Date reviewed: 2013-05-20 22:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting manuscript describing the most relevant characteristics of Esophageal cancer. However major revision are needed: ? Being squamous cell carcinoma of the esophagus and adenocarcinoma of the cardia different in all characteristics, they should be discussed separately in all sections. It could be better to organize the manuscript into two separate paragraphs, including all section in each paragraph. ? A table or a flow chart of prevention, diagnostic and treatment strategy should be included. ? Siewert classification should be included and discussed.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3706

Title: epidemiology of esophageal cancer

Reviewer code: 00038617

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-05-16 15:28

Date reviewed: 2013-05-31 00:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The author described a good review article about epidemiology of esophageal cancer. Most of the parts were well written. However, the section 9, "diagnosis and treatment" is the quality of being insufficient because there are no description of endoscopic submucosal dissection (ESD) and important clinical studies of the RTOG, etc. Since the title of this paper is "Epidemiology of esophageal cancer", the author should delete this section. Minor comments In section 5 (survival), last sentence should be excluded because the same sentence exist in this section (Page 6, Line 5-6). In section 2 (pathology and anatomy), the author described only about two main types of esophageal cancer. However, in this section the author should add the description of the other minor pathological types of esophageal cancer, such as small cell carcinoma, carcinosarcoma and so on.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3706

Title: epidemiology of esophageal cancer

Reviewer code: 02520448

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-05-16 15:28

Date reviewed: 2013-05-31 18:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Author, The subject of the manuscript is very important, but the manuscript does not give Novel information to the field and does not fulfill the criteria for a review article. There are many data without references like the 1st and the last paragraphs of "pathology and anatomy"; the 1st, the 4th and the last paragraph of "Incidence"; the 1st paragraph of "risk factors"; the whole section of "Chronic Irritation"; the 2nd paragraph of "Screening and early detection". Also it does not cover information regarding the high prevalence countries for esophageal cancer. Furthermore, it was better to divide esophageal cancer into two main categories: SCC and Adenocarcinoma and discuss them separately. With Regards,



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3706

Title: epidemiology of esophageal cancer

Reviewer code: 00185686

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-05-16 15:28

Date reviewed: 2013-06-10 21:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

this is a well done review about esophageal cancer. some minor corrections to do: - page 2, paragraph introduction: the sentence: "currently, EsC is the eight most common is unclear... - page 4, paragraph incidence, "men and women" could be replace by "persons". - page 6: the sentence "the overall 5-year relative survival..." appears 2 times in the page. some references must be added. some important european studies are not cited in the reference paragraph: 1 Dig Liver Dis. 2013 Feb 28. pii: S1590-8658(13)00008-X. doi: 10.1016/j.dld.2012.12.020. [Epub ahead of print] Epidemiology and risk factors for oesophageal adenocarcinoma. Lepage C, Drouillard A, Jouve JL, Faivre J. 2. Eur J Cancer. 2012 Jul;48(10):1417-24. doi: 10.1016/j.ejca.2011.10.038. Epub 2011 Dec 9. Incidence, prevalence and survival of patients with rare epithelial digestive cancers diagnosed in Europe in 1995-2002. Faivre J, Trama A, De Angelis R, Elferink M, Siesling S, Audisio R, Bosset JF, Cervantes A, Lepage C; RARECARE Working Group. 3. Am J Gastroenterol. 2008 Nov;103(11):2694-9. doi: 10.1111/j.1572-0241.2008.02191.x. Epub 2008 Oct 3. Continuing rapid increase in esophageal adenocarcinoma in England and Wales. Lepage C, Racht B, Jooste V, Faivre J, Coleman MP. Source London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine, London, UK.