

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 28377

**Title:** BK nephropathy in the native kidneys of patients with organ transplants: Clinical spectrum of BK infection

**Reviewer's code:** 00503339

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-07-01 18:11

**Date reviewed:** 2016-07-14 02:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Good job of clarifying the changing picture of BK Infection and Nephropathy with special relevance to solid organ transplants. The problem of containing too much detail for a Journal article (502 references, nearly 100 pages) and how to retain its message while enhancing its readability should be addressed. Dividing the paper into three portions is one device that would help while adding a "Key Take Home Points" list would also be beneficial. Overall, a solid contribution clarifying the status of a problem of vital concern for all involved in Transplant Medicine.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 28377

**Title:** BK nephropathy in the native kidneys of patients with organ transplants: Clinical spectrum of BK infection

**Reviewer's code:** 03509648

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-07-01 18:11

**Date reviewed:** 2016-07-15 21:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article is very in-depth and includes excellent references and will be a good source material for students and readers

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 28377

**Title:** BK nephropathy in the native kidneys of patients with organ transplants: Clinical spectrum of BK infection

**Reviewer's code:** 00005191

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-07-01 18:11

**Date reviewed:** 2016-07-17 17:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Severe disease in transplanted kidneys was the first recognized human disease caused by BK virus, a member of the Papoviridae family of viruses. BK nephropathy (BKN) was recognized as an emerging problem in renal transplant recipients with the introduction of improved immunosuppressive treatments. Renal transplant failure rates due to BKN can reach as high as 50-80% within 24 months. In recent years, reports of BKN in native kidneys and of BKV infection in other organ systems have emerged with increasing frequency in non-renal solid organ and bone marrow transplant patients (bone marrow, heart, lung, liver and pancreas), as well as in other immunosuppressed patients, such as patients with AIDS or patients treated for malignant tumors. BK virus also causes severe disease of the urinary bladder, the brain, the lungs, the gut and the blood. The diagnosis and particularly the management of infection by BK virus still present difficulties. Research for new mediators specific for treating this infection is crucial. Two cases are described before the Authors start a long and extremely well documented review. Its main goal is to summarize the clinical characteristics, diagnosis, pathophysiology and treatment of BKV infection in patients with solid organ and bone



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

marrow transplantation, and to address manifestations of BKV infection outside the urologic system and in patients without organ transplants. An exceptionally extensive list of references is attached indicating the rising interest in this topic for all kinds of organ transplant and in other patient population (HIV, patients with various malignancies, infections with manifestations from the urinary system). Diagnosis, pathogenesis, modes of transmission and current practices in the prevention and management of BK infection of BKN are thoroughly treated in separate sections. The review ends with a mention on the expansion of the number of diseases attributed to the Polyomaviridae viral family. No doubt this virus family will have a center stage in organ transplantation in the years to come. The manuscript is well-written, very well-researched and can be a useful and comprehensive review for all the clinicians involved with the topic treated. There are no major, nor minor revisions to be made to style and content. However, the Authors could maybe consider moving the case report section after the general introduction, provided that the Journal's editorial rules allow this.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Transplantation

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 28377

**Title:** BK nephropathy in the native kidneys of patients with organ transplants: Clinical spectrum of BK infection

**Reviewer's code:** 00505314

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2016-07-01 18:11

**Date reviewed:** 2016-07-28 00:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an extensive review of the literature on BK virus infection in renal and non renal organ transplant recipients. The article is well written and very informative. Will be very useful for clinicians involved in the care of transplant recipients and other immunocompromized hosts.