

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 51472

Title: Retrospective cohort study of statin therapy effect on resected colorectal liver metastases

Reviewer's code: 03475779

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Academic Fellow, Associate Professor, Surgeon, Teacher

Reviewer's country: Italy

Author's country: United Kingdom

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-10-08 07:14

Reviewer performed review: 2019-10-11 12:10

Review time: 3 Days and 4 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Good , well written and documented paper.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 51472

Title: Retrospective cohort study of statin therapy effect on resected colorectal liver metastases

Reviewer's code: 00068720

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MSc

Professional title: Attending Doctor, Professor

Reviewer's country: China

Author's country: United Kingdom

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-10-10 05:12

Reviewer performed review: 2019-10-13 15:53

Review time: 3 Days and 10 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. The authors reported statin therapy does not affect patient survival following liver resection for colorectal liver metastases (CRLM), and the reason for this key finding is that statins do not modulate tumour biology of CRLM. The paper is of some scientific interest and clinical value. 2. The quality of work reported in the paper is average. (1) The organization and analysis of results need improvement. The results are not well defined and need improvement, and methods introduction should moved to Methods section. (2) The authors indicate that "The IMD did not have a significant relationship with the use of statins ($p=0.253$)". The authors should discuss this point in more detail (Statistical analysis). (3) In Statistical analysis and Table 3, the statistical significance between each groups should be explained in more detail, and if possible, add some statistical parameters (P value, e.g.). (4) The different types and different doses of statins should be explained in more detail in Methods and Results section. Can you further explain in the comparison of results?

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 51472

Title: Retrospective cohort study of statin therapy effect on resected colorectal liver metastases

Reviewer's code: 02569202

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Research Scientist

Reviewer's country: Spain

Author's country: United Kingdom

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-10-09 09:15

Reviewer performed review: 2019-10-15 05:42

Review time: 5 Days and 20 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

The manuscript analyses the impact of statins on resected colorectal liver metastases. This is an interesting approach, but some major aspects should be checked/explained:

- In this type of work, usually there are some inclusion and exclusion criteria, how was this process done? Please, explain.
- Please, analyze in details the weakness of the work.
- Please, analyze the impact of time under medication as well as type of statin on the final result; in this line, while refining data maybe some conclusion could be determined.

The authors mention that they have not taken into account the individual statins because there are no reports on this topic, but this is the novelty of the work. Please, consider.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 51472

Title: Retrospective cohort study of statin therapy effect on resected colorectal liver metastases

Reviewer's code: 03478911

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Chief Technician, Executive Vice President, Research Assistant Professor

Reviewer's country: South Korea

Author's country: United Kingdom

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-10-09 09:03

Reviewer performed review: 2019-10-18 00:56

Review time: 8 Days and 15 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this retrospective study, the authors reported that statin therapy did not affect the survival of patients after liver resection for colon hepatic metastasis, and they reported as a major reason why statins do not participate in tumor biological process. The results are well-organized according to the author's research, but there is one issue with statistical analysis. In presenting the results of each table, there is no indication of statistical significance between groups. It should be supplemented for that issue.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No