

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9509

Title: Risk factors for combined hepatocellular-cholangiocarcinoma: a hospital-based case-control study

Reviewer code: 01557283

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2014-02-15 12:58

Date reviewed: 2014-03-11 14:04

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The aim of the present study was to investigate the etiology of combined hepatocellular-cholangiocarcinoma (CHC). The authors analyzed 126 patients with CHC, surprisingly a large number, from a single institution. The results presented were very important, but further analyses may be needed. Major comments: 1. Materials and Methods. Cases and controls. The authors did not mention how many patients underwent hepatic resection and how many patients did not undergo hepatectomy. The pathological diagnosis of CHC may be difficult using biopsy specimens. Therefore, the authors should describe these points. 2. The pathological definition of CHC should be described, e.g., confirmation of HCC components examined by HepPar1 staining, anti-CD10 staining, and alpha-fetoprotein, and detection of biliary component shown by CK-7, CK-19, etc. 3. Results. The comparison of clinicopathological characteristics between CHC and healthy controls seems important. However, results of CHC compared to HCC patients or to CCC patients may bring more information. Can the authors compare the etiological results among CHC, HCC, and intrahepatic cholangiocarcinoma? 4. Recent some reports focused on a relationship between Non-B Non-C HCC and anti-Hepatitis B-c antibody. Can the authors mention about a relationship between CHC and anti-HBc antibody? 5. Can the authors mention whether the prevention of neonatal HBV infection is now performed in China? How might liver cancer decrease in China after the prevention of neonatal HBV infection?

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9509

Title: Risk factors for combined hepatocellular-cholangiocarcinoma: a hospital-based case-control study

Reviewer code: 01429599

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2014-02-15 12:58

Date reviewed: 2014-03-13 23:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper by Zhou et al deals with an important clinical problem, i.e. the risk factors for hepatocellular-cholangiocarcinoma. Although the studied population is relevant, the study shows some important bias; in particular the lack of a control Group characterized by cirrhotic patients. In fact it should be important to compare the frequency of suggested risk factors not only in the cases and in the healthy controls, but also in cirrhotic patients. In fact the Authors have identified HBV as an important risk factor.