

03 April 2013

Dear Editor,

Please find enclosed the edited manuscript in Word format (file name: 8640-edited.doc).

Title: Treatment of meniscal tears: an evidence based approach

Author: Simon C Mordecai, Nawfal Al-Hadithy, Howard E Ware, Chinmay M Gupte

Name of Journal: *World Journal of Orthopedics*

ESPS Manuscript NO: 8640

The manuscript has been improved according to the suggestions of reviewers:

1 Format has been updated

2 Revision has been made according to the suggestions of the reviewers

Reviewer 505427 commented that it was a well written paper discussing treatment for meniscal tears with no comments for improvement.

Reviewer 2459226 provided feedback for a systematic review and made some valid points. However we were invited to write a review article on the treatment of meniscal tears and not a systematic review. For a review article we feel this is an extremely comprehensive and detailed up to date analysis of the current evidence for treating meniscal tears.

The final reviewer highlighted the importance of this paper. We believe this paper to be the most up to date review on this topic and also proving a completely unique meniscal tear management tree. The management tree has been put together from the papers discussed in the review as well as specialist input from the senior authors.

We agree that the manuscript should be broken down into subtitles for a more logical flow.

We have divided the manuscript into six sub headings:

Anatomical structure

Classification of meniscal tears

Non-operative management

Meniscectomy

Meniscal Repair

Meniscal repair techniques

3 References and typesetting were corrected

Thank you again for publishing our manuscript in the *World Journal of Orthopedics*.

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'SM', written in a cursive style.

Simon C Mordecai,

Imperial College NHS Trust,

St Mary's and Charing Cross Hospitals,

Praed St, London, W21NY.

Simon.mordecai@gmail.com