



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 45786

Title: Stereotactic body radiation therapy in patients with hepatocellular carcinoma: A mini-review

Reviewer’s code: 03721686

Reviewer’s country: Romania

Science editor: Ying Dou

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-01-17 14:41

Reviewer performed review: 2019-01-19 14:50

Review time: 2 Days

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|---|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This minireview addresses SBRT as a promising treatment option for HCC accompanied by low rates of toxicity. The authors have debated feasibility and synergistic effects of combotherapy with other local treatments. They have also



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

included possible disadvantages, challenges and limitations of the method. SBRT is an innovation in radiotherapy for HCC management, but more direct comparative studies and more randomized controlled trials are needed in order to make future firm conclusions of interest for a multidisciplinary team including a radiation oncologist. Although the manuscript is very well written and useful, there are minor concerns outlined below that should be addressed by the authors: - In Stereotactic body radiation therapy (SBRT): Indications and techniques section, reference should be added for „Caution is advised also in patients with central tumors closely related to larger bile ducts because SBRT may result in bile duct stenosis.” - In SBRT: clinical evidence section, reference should be added as well for “Moreover, SBRT also showed a clearly favorable toxicity profile.” - The careful proofreading and minor language polishing are needed.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

Manuscript NO: 45786

Title: Stereotactic body radiation therapy in patients with hepatocellular carcinoma: A mini-review

Reviewer’s code: 03004570

Reviewer’s country: Turkey

Science editor: Ying Dou

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-01-17 17:44

Reviewer performed review: 2019-01-22 05:28

Review time: 4 Days and 11 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY | LANGUAGE QUALITY | CONCLUSION | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS |
|--|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review: |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language | (High priority) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of | (General priority) | Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not | language polishing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript: |
| publish | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
| | | | Conflicts-of-Interest: |
| | | | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes |
| | | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This mini-review perfectly summarizes SBRT in patients with HCC. Figures and tables are informative. I recommend only adding some little informations (1-2 sentences) about fiducials (properties, placement etc) explaining the technique, and particle therapy



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

(protons??) in future directions to be completed this review. There are some small typing errors; please correct "table 1" as "Table 1" in pp 6, "table 2" as Table 2 in pp 7. Similarly please correct "irradiation" as irradiation and "cacinoma" as carcinoma in reference #43. After all corrections, this manuscript will be an up-to-date resource about SBRT, not only for radiation oncologists but also all oncology community.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No