

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4629

**Title:** Colonic Tumour Precipitating Caecal Bascule within a Diaphragmatic Hernia

**Reviewer code:** 00068638

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-07-12 09:05

**Date reviewed:** 2013-07-12 15:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper described about the experience of 'Colonic Tumour within a Diaphragmatic Hernia'. The authors speculated the existence of caecal bascule. On the other hand, the authors also mentioned bowel obstruction was secondary to a diaphragmatic hernia, in the Discussion paragraph. Major issue of this paper is whether the case was caecal bascule or normal volvulus. This lack of fixation of the cecum can result in two distinct forms of volvulus. The majority of the time, the torsion occurs in a clockwise axial direction about the vascular pedicle. In the remaining patients, the cecum and ascending colon fold anteriorly and upward without an axial twist, forming a so-called bascule, a form of closed loop obstruction. Authors mentioned 'The caecum was twisted 270° inside the hernial sac', in the Management paragraph. This sentence strongly suggested the case was not caecal bascule but normal caecal volvulus. If the authors want to insist the case as caecal volvulus, they should show more definite evidence. I also do not understand from this manuscript why the ischemia of cecum occurred in the case. Due to caecal volvulus? Due to incarceration of diaphragmatic hernia? The authors should make this clear. Minor issue The role of caecal tumor is unclear in this case. Can caecal tumor induce caecal volvulus? More speculation is needed about this issue. I agree this case report described a rare case. But the authors have to address to above major issues logically if they want their paper to be published.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4629

**Title:** Colonic Tumour Precipitating Caecal Bascule within a Diaphragmatic Hernia

**Reviewer code:** 01207047

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-07-12 09:05

**Date reviewed:** 2013-07-12 18:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1-I realize that the whole article was written by the surgeons. I had difficulty understanding the "serosal tears". I think, it would be more appropriate for the "serosal tears" to be explained and the microscopic tumor morphology to be described in detail by a pathologist. 2-There are some spelling errors.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4629

**Title:** Colonic Tumour Precipitating Caecal Bascule within a Diaphragmatic Hernia

**Reviewer code:** 00053652

**Science editor:** Gou, Su-Xin

**Date sent for review:** 2013-07-12 09:05

**Date reviewed:** 2013-07-22 13:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled "Colonic Tumour Precipitating Caecal Bascule within a Diaphragmatic Hernia" evaluated hernia which is a very rare condition and concluded that above condition could have precipitated to the colonic tumour. The case study may be accepted for publication after minor revision in light of the following comments: 1. Details of the methodology used should be provided briefly. 2. Proper Introduction should be provided with latest references describing both the conditions.