

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 30377

Title: Annexin A2 as a biomarker for hepatocellular carcinoma in Egyptian patients

Reviewer's code: 03699981

Reviewer's country: Thailand

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-09-30 17:39

Date reviewed: 2016-11-07 01:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors prospective case control studied 50 early stage HCC, 25 CLD and 15 healthy age-, sex-matched subjects with seronegative for viral markers of hepatitis and normal liver function. AFP and Annexin A2 was measured from each subjects. Authors concluded that Annexin A2 at cut off value at 18 ng/mL was a good diagnostic marker for early HCC Critism; 1) Any patients in group 1(early stage HCC) had CLD? Any co HBV and HCV infection in this group? 2) What is definition of CLD? Characterisitics of CLD (child pugh, cause of CLD) 3) Any HCC patients had normal AFP but high Annexin A2? 4) the sensitivity and specificity of AFP as a screening test was different depend on the level of cut off point. AFP value of 20 ng/mL (which commonly used in other previous screening studies - Sherman, Hepatology (1995) , Zhang, J Cancer Res Clin Oncol (2004) , Wong, Liver inter (2008)) had sensitivity of 60%. If AFP cut off is raised to 200 ng/mL, the sensitivity drops to 22% (Bruix, 2010) but AFP at cut off point of 19.8 ng/mL was not different diagnostic accuracy than Annexin A2 in the study. The sensitivity of both test was 70%, therefore 30% of HCC will miss from either test.