

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 18875

**Title:** Nutritional assessment in cirrhotic patients with hepatic encephalopathy

**Reviewer's code:** 00051758

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Jing Yu

**Date sent for review:** 2015-05-06 07:43

**Date reviewed:** 2015-07-29 18:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[ Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[ Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a comprehensive and well-written review on nutritional assessment in patients with cirrhosis and hepatic encephalopathy (HE). A few minor issues: - I am not sure how HE-directed the presented work is, so maybe the title could be made more general. As the authors repeatedly state, in several instances the info is on nutrition-cirrhosis rather than nutrition-HE. - I would not say HE is lethal (page 1) - patients tend to die "in" rather than "of" hepatic coma. - There is some degree of confusion (pages 6-7) between HE and other sources of metabolic encephalopathy or structural brain damage in cirrhosis. Hyponatremia, sepsis and malnutrition can cause encephalopathy (not HE) in subjects who are not cirrhotic, and encephalopathies of different aetiology should not be confused, even if they are present at the same time. Similarly, prolonged alcohol misuse may favour the manifestations (by way of brain damage) but not cause HE.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 18875

**Title:** Nutritional assessment in cirrhotic patients with hepatic encephalopathy

**Reviewer's code:** 02861217

**Reviewer's country:** Armenia

**Science editor:** Jing Yu

**Date sent for review:** 2015-05-06 07:43

**Date reviewed:** 2015-08-18 15:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[ Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[ Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Fernando Gomes Romeiro, Your manuscript is a rather detail overview on very important topic "nutritional assessment in cirrhotic patients with hepatic encephalopathy". You describe pathophysiological mechanisms of HE, but nutritional assessment methods descriptions poorly correlate with them. From my point of view it will be better to offer a practical algorithm for choosing mentioned methods depend on patient precise status. Nevertheless, your manuscript could be published in WJG. Best regards