

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 33214

Title: Implication of the Hedgehog pathway in hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00070056

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-02-10

Date reviewed: 2017-02-12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, the author reviewed the current data on the role of HH pathway reactivation in the development and progression of HCC. The manuscript is of great interest and comprehensive. I suggest that it should be accepted for publication in the journal of WJG. However, there are some problems to be addressed. 1. In the part of evidence of HH activation in human tumor tissues, many researches were conducted on the expression and prognostic value of HH proteins in HCC specimen. I suggested that the author make a table to provide the details of each study. 2. I suggested that the author provided a cartoon figures concerning the mechanisms of HH pathway in the carcinogenesis and evolution of HCC.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 33214

Title: Implication of the Hedgehog pathway in hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03478199

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-02-22

Date reviewed: 2017-03-05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. The authors aimed at summarizing the role of Hedgehog(HH) pathway reactivation in development and progression of hepatocellular carcinoma(HCC). The emphasis should be how HH pathway play the crucial role in the process of carcinogenesis and progression, however the prognosis value of HH pathway was emphasized with an independent subtitle(Figure 1). Maybe it is more appropriate in the discussion part. 2. HH pathway activation can induce angiogenesis, which should be inferred in this article. 3. The subtitles in Figure 1 should be corresponding to the subtitles in the content. So, some point of the Figure 1 should be revised according to the advice above. 4. The first sentence in last paragraph said that HH pathway deserves a future exploration as an independent prognostic marker for HCC progression and as a therapeutic target. The sentence is not accurate. Please change it. 5. There are spelling mistakes like proliferation, limited and so on.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 33214

Title: Implication of the Hedgehog pathway in hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02941534

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-02-10

Date reviewed: 2017-03-07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, the authors reviewed the literature and the role of the hedgehog pathway in patients with HCC. I read the manuscript with great interest that it is very comprehensive. I suggest that it should be accepted for publication in the journal of WJG. My suggestions are; - The authors stated that sorafenib is still the only available therapeutic option of HCC advanced patients but we know that regorafenib has also significant activity in patients with HCC that relapse after sorafenib in a randomized trial

([http://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736\(16\)32453-9/abstract](http://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736(16)32453-9/abstract))

- The role and previous results of immunotherapy also promising and should be mentioned in the manuscript.