BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

# ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology
**ESPS manuscript NO:** 17661
**Title:** Potentiality of immunotherapy against hepatocellular carcinoma
**Reviewer's code:** 02861124
**Reviewer's country:** Saudi Arabia
**Science editor:** Yuan Qi
**Date sent for review:** 2015-03-18 09:07
**Date reviewed:** 2015-03-24 15:59

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|---|---|
| [ ] Grade A: Excellent | [ ] Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | [ Y] Accept |
| [ Y] Grade B: Very good | [ Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing | [ ] The same title | [ ] High priority for publication |
| [ ] Grade C: Good | [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | [ ] Duplicate publication | [ ] Rejection |
| [ ] Grade D: Fair | [ ] Grade D: Rejected | [ ] Plagiarism | [ ] Minor revision |
| [ ] Grade E: Poor | | [ Y ] No | [ ] Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | [ ] The same title | |
| | | [ ] Duplicate publication | |
| | | [ ] Plagiarism | |
| | | [ Y ] No | |

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear authors, Overall, the manuscript is well conceived, designed and written. However, It would be great to add a pictorial/cartoon depiction of molecular targets of malignant hepatic tissues. Some minor language polishing, including font style, and inclusion of some expanded forms of abbreviation and references are required that have been suggested in the manuscript (track-change).

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

# ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology
**ESPS manuscript NO:** 17661
**Title:** Potentiality of immunotherapy against hepatocellular carcinoma
**Reviewer's code:** 02861131
**Reviewer's country:** Moldova
**Science editor:** Yuan Qi
**Date sent for review:** 2015-03-18 09:07
**Date reviewed:** 2015-04-02 06:12

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|---|---|
| [ ] Grade A: Excellent | [ Y] Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | [ ] Accept |
| [ ] Grade B: Very good | [ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing | [ ] The same title | [ ] High priority for publication |
| [ Y] Grade C: Good | [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | [ ] Duplicate publication | [ ] Rejection |
| [ ] Grade D: Fair | [ ] Grade D: Rejected | [ ] Plagiarism | [ Y] Minor revision |
| [ ] Grade E: Poor | | [ Y ] No | [ ] Major revision |
| | | BPG Search: | |
| | | [ ] The same title | |
| | | [ ] Duplicate publication | |
| | | [ ] Plagiarism | |
| | | [ Y ] No | |

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Manuscript Number: 17661 Manuscript Title: THE POTENTIALITY OF IMMUNOTHERAPY AGAINST HEPATOCELLULAR CARCINOMA. COMMENTS TO AUTHORS GENERAL COMMENTS (1) The importance of the research and the significance of the research contents; The authors of this article have been evaluated the tumor immunotherapy as a novel therapy of hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC), the predominant form of primary liver cancer. The importance and significant of the research contents is high, because the current therapeutic options have only modest efficacy. Novel immunotherapies has potential as an effective treatment modality for HCC (prolong survival in patients with advanced HCC and minimize the risk of adverse reactions) and indeed, is gaining broad attention from both scientists and clinicians. (2) The novelty and innovation of the research; Nobuhiro Tsuchiya et al. as an active participation of clinical trials using novel immunotherapies (1) presents in this article unpublished data about TAA targeted therapy and suggest that GPC3-derived peptide vaccines represent a novel immunotherapeutic strategy for patients with HCC, with the potential to improve overall survival. The novelty of the research represents the idea that it is necessary: 1) to better define the patient population that will benefit from

immunologic therapies; 2) to determine which combination strategies with immunotherapy and conventional cancer therapy (such as chemotherapy and radiotherapy) are more effective; and 3) to appreciate sufficient evaluation criteria for immunotherapy (3) Presentation and readability of the manuscript; Review is well organized, and systematic theoretical analyses and valuable conclusions are provided. This review is a classically presented scientific article. (4) Ethics of the research. Not relevant for this article (this article is review) Bibliography 1. Sawada Y, Yoshikawa T, Nobuoka D, Shirakawa H, Kuronuma T, Motomura Y, Mizuno S, Ishii H, Nakachi K, Konishi M, Nakagohri T, Takahashi S, Gotohda N, Takayama T, Yamao K, Uesaka K, Furuse J, Kinoshita T, Nakatsura T. Phase I trial of a glypican-3-derived peptide vaccine for advanced hepatocellular carcinoma: immunologic evidence and potential for improving overall survival. Clinical cancer research : an official journal of the American Association for Cancer Research 2012; 18(13): 3686-3696 [PMID: 22577059 DOI: 10.1158/1078-0432.CCR-11-3044] SPECIFIC COMMENTS Title: accurately reflects the major topic and contents of the study. Abstract: it gives a clear delineation of the research background, objectives and main point presented in this review. As summarized, the review highline that Immunotherapy would be the forefront of HCC treatment in the near future. Review is well organized, and systematic theoretical analyses and valuable conclusions are provided. Introduction: present relevant information about epidemiology of HCC, limits of traditional therapy of HCC (surgical, local ablative therapy, chemotherapy) and potential benefits of immunotherapy. Not presented: aims of the study. The immune responses in HCC This part is well organized, and had systematic theoretical analyses. (for better understanding of tumor-specific cellular and humoral immune responses, which occur in patients with HCC need to introduce figure with targets for immunotherapeutic agents ). Need to be worry with abbreviation (in p. 6 regulatory DCs, CTLA-4, PD-L1 we find explanation only on p 10,12 ) Immunotherapy for HCC Cytokine therapy TAA targeted therapy Immune checkpoint inhibitors Cell transfer immunotherapy In the end of this part will be very useful to introduce a table with short analysis of all of this information. Conclusions The authors present valuable conclusion References: references are appropriate, relevant, and updated. Tables and figures: tables is very big and not very informative.