

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28409

Title: Irritable bowel syndrome evaluation using CT colonography

Reviewer's code: 03647631

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-06-30 16:14

Date reviewed: 2016-07-13 00:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study provides new information regarding the morphologic differences found in patients with IBS-C and FC vs IBS-D and patients without defecatory disorders. However, the authors imply in their conclusion that the morphologic differences are somehow causative of their disorders. Animal models have demonstrated that chronic withholding or forced constipation causes lengthening or dilation of the colon; could it be that these patients had normal morphology prior to onset of symptoms but now have developed lengthened and dilated colons? In addition, the Rome criteria were developed as a method to diagnose functional digestive disorders without the need to subject the patient to invasive, expensive tests or procedures. If a patient meets criteria for IBS-C or D or FC, they should not require colonoscopy or CTC to evaluate the colonic morphology or mucosa. I feel that these issues need to be addressed prior to publication, but that the ideas and information in this manuscript are interesting and important.