

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31871

Title: Risk factors for hepatocellular carcinoma in cirrhosis due to nonalcoholic fatty liver disease: A multicenter, case-control study

Reviewer's code: 03648851

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-07-13 17:17

Date reviewed: 2016-07-25 07:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Kathleen et al. found male gender, increased age, and non-Hispanic ethnicity are associated with HCC in NASH cirrhosis, and suggested that these parameters may be useful for diagnosis and treatment of NASH cirrhosis associated HCC. It is an important report and I think that it is suitable for publication in World Journal of Gastroenterology if author have revised the following points. 1. Author should clarify whether some biochemical parameters, which have reported the involvement in the progression of NASH, for example AST/ALT and iron level, is associated with HCC in NASH cirrhosis. 2. It should be suggested why the risk of HCC is decreased in the Hispanic ethnicity

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31871

Title: Risk factors for hepatocellular carcinoma in cirrhosis due to nonalcoholic fatty liver disease: A multicenter, case-control study

Reviewer's code: 00746598

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-07-13 17:17

Date reviewed: 2016-07-27 10:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The topic of NAFLD --> cirrhosis --> HCC is important and still under-appreciated. The study is retrospective but well executed with decent numbers. The main result that older men were at greater risk/had higher rates of HCC development fits with observations with respect to other etiologies of HCC--this point might be emphasized. A few clarifications would improve the manuscript: 1) what were the NAFLD/NASH durations (ages at onset) in cases and controls? 2) Were there gender differences with respect to occurrence of cirrhosis, i.e. was it more common in females overall? 3) It would be of interest to consider metabolic syndrome as a variable rather than its components. 4) with regard to histopathology, were there differences in severity of fatty liver [grades] between cases and controls, men and women? This is not a question about fibrosis or cirrhosis--just the degree of steatosis and steatohepatitis 5) Since males predominated for HCC, it would be of interest to analyze data along sex lines to try identifying factors in men or women associated with HCC.