Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 3230
Title: Prediction of a novel pathogenicity island in Helicobacter pylori using a genomic bar-coding approach
Reviewer code: 00503623
Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin
Date sent for review: 2013-04-16 10:21
Date reviewed: 2013-04-17 23:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)		[ ] Existed	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
The MS No. 3230 presents the application of genomic barcode technique to identification of pathogenicity islands (PAIs) in H. pylori. By mapping the generated barcode images of the available H. pylori genomes the authors were able to identify a known pathogenicity island, CagA as well as the DNA fragments associated with new PAIs. While the applied technique is interesting and effective, the authors make no attempt to elaborate what are the clinical implications of the presented studies, and how this relates to the virulence potential of Hp. Moreover, the Introduction relays heavily on the importance of VacA and CagA in Hp. virulence, but virtually neglects the virulence potential of Hp. LPS. This is in spite a large volume of data on the LPS and Hp. virulence. After all, it is Hp. LPS, and not cag or vac, that is the ligand for TLR4 receptor of the host. Further, "lipoproteins" are not putative Hp. toxins, as erroneously stated in the Introduction (second sentence). Perhaps the authors meant lipopolysaccharide ?. If so, then this should be corrected.

Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 3230
Title: Prediction of a novel pathogenicity island in Helicobacter pylori using a genomic bar-coding approach
Reviewer code: 00503587
Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin
Date sent for review: 2013-04-16 10:21
Date reviewed: 2013-04-21 10:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)		[ ] Existed	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
This manuscript outlines the results arising from the application of a new bar-coding technique to the assessment of acquired genetic material. Overall Comment: Although our understanding of the nature of the gastric pathogen H. pylori has advanced greatly, there remain gaps in our knowledge. The application of new approaches promises to permit new discoveries. Specific Comments: 1. In the Results part of the Abstract, the authors imply that the PAI combine in a synergy to create a type 4 secretion system. This is not clear, and may not be clearly defined in this work: revision of this statement is suggested 2. There are some errors of English structure, grammar and formatting through the manuscript. some words (e.g. stomach) are listed in plural but should be singular. The phrase "and so on" is not appropriate. Some lists of words are not completed with "and" between the last and second last term. 3. This manuscript incorporates the Results and Discussion sections as one section. The structure of the Manuscript should follow the requirements of the journal strictly. 4. In the Results section the phrase "most genomes" should be revised to be more clear and specific. 5.The order of the Figures/Tables/References should be corrected to be that expected by the journal. Similarly, the references do not follow the journal's requirements. 6. The authors do not include any functional analysis of their proposed novel PAI. Further work to support the genetic potentials mentioned would greatly enhance this work. Although this may be beyond the remit of the current manuscript, this should at least be mentioned in the conclusions as an important further step

Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 3230
Title: Prediction of a novel pathogenicity island in Helicobacter pylori using a genomic bar-coding approach
Reviewer code: 00199528
Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin
Date sent for review: 2013-04-16 10:21
Date reviewed: 2013-04-22 09:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
'

Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 3230
Title: Prediction of a novel pathogenicity island in Helicobacter pylori using a genomic bar-coding approach
Reviewer code: 01115220
Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin
Date sent for review: 2013-04-16 10:21
Date reviewed: 2013-04-30 17:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
This is an interesting short paper looking at novel methods of intergating H pylori genomic hedata. The methodology and desrcription of a potential novel papthogenicity island are interesting. The paper is well presented and the ideas are clear.