

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10621

Title: Renal Aspergillosis in Liver Transplantation recipients: clinical and imaging manifestations in Two Cases and review of literatures

Reviewer code: 02566971

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-04-10 17:29

Date reviewed: 2014-04-12 10:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I read this manuscript with interest. It described a rare case of localized aspergillus infection within the kidney after liver transplantation. Descent work has been done in describing the imaging features of this rare opportunistic infection. However I have several major concerns which may lower the superiority of this manuscript to be considered publication in WJG.

1) This work is mainly focused on the radiological features and targets limited audience, therefore is more suitable to be submitted to a radiology journal. Or this can be considered publication as "clinical image" instead of an "original article" or "Case report", with several CT/MRI films plus a brief description of the radiological features and review of literature.

2) Although this paper is titled ".....: clinical and imaging manifestations in Two Cases and review of literatures", I hardly see any literature review. Instead, the authors mentioned "According to our knowledge, RAsp has not been reported in liver transplantation recipients up to now." So this is merely a manifestation of Aspergillosis in a different organ, therefore the review of literature part can be focused on "Aspergillosis after (liver) transplantation".

3) Several grammatical and clerical errors need further proof-reading.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10621

Title: Renal Aspergillosis in Liver Transplantation recipients: clinical and imaging manifestations in Two Cases and review of literatures

Reviewer code: 01560498

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-04-10 17:29

Date reviewed: 2014-04-12 15:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Aspergillosis is fatal for immunocompromised patients. Renal aspergillosis is very rare, and Shan H, et al reported this rare infection in two liver transplantation recipients. Imaging examinations may provide diagnostic information. Authors focused the imaging features in this paper. Though they did not seem to reveal informative findings, authors suggested that CT/MRI is important for the early diagnosis, surveillance and treatment. Early diagnosis and subsequent therapy may improve the survival rate. This paper was well written, and I guess it is informative for clinical practice.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10621

Title: Renal Aspergillosis in Liver Transplantation recipients: clinical and imaging manifestations in Two Cases and review of literatures

Reviewer code: 02730861

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-04-10 17:29

Date reviewed: 2014-04-30 15:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

For Authors: Although advances in immunosuppressive therapy have led to an increased survival rate of the transplant recipients, the greater risk of developing life-threatening fungal infection still is a serious problem. Aspergillus is the second most common cause of the opportunistic fungal infections after liver transplantation, with the incidence rate around 0.7-8%. The manuscript by Xiao-chun M et al. described two cases of renal aspergillosis in liver transplantation recipients and they reviewed in detail the related literatures. This paper is undoubtedly worth to be published in World Journal of Gastroenterology in the present style because this paper is a first report about renal aspergillosis in liver transplantation recipients, and enough detailed to be very useful in clinical setting. Also, I recommend the authors describe in more detail the possible etiology of renal aspergillosis in their own cases. Major comments: 1. The authors need to describe in more detail the possible etiology of renal aspergillosis in their own cases. Minor comments: 1. page 13, line4: The word "samphotericin B" should be changed into "amphotericin B. 2. page 24, line 3 and 4: The words "(□)" should be corrected.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10621

Title: Renal Aspergillosis in Liver Transplantation recipients: clinical and imaging manifestations in Two Cases and review of literatures

Reviewer code: 02527554

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-04-10 17:29

Date reviewed: 2014-05-01 09:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Meng et al. reported two renal aspergillus infection after liver transplantation, and well described the imaging characteristics of CT and MRI in kidney. The authors successfully treated aspergillus infection by nephrectomy for these two cases. Although this disease entity is rare reported and worth to mention, there are many concerns regarding this paper. 1. In case one, the patient had been undergone nephrectomy because of highly suspicious of malignancy. The authors concluded that CT/MRI is useful in diagnosis of aspergillus infection. Hence, the authors should clarify the role of CT/MRI in differential diagnosis of malignancy to renal aspergillus infection? 2. How is the FK level in liver transplantation of the author's institute? 3. Is there any serum data regarding aspergillus infection such as galactomannan test? 4. Although these two cases were successful treated by surgical intervention, the authors should review and recommend on the timing of surgical treatment? For example, surgical intervention followed by antifungal failure or surgical resection first followed by adjuvant antifungal treatment.