



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13721

Title: Transitions of histopathologic criteria for diagnosis of nonalcoholic fatty liver disease during the last three decades

Reviewer code: 00054275

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-08-29 16:58

Date reviewed: 2014-09-11 23:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In my opinion in a a review about histopathologic criteria in NASH/NAFLD at least three items should be evaluated and/or better discussed: 1 Very often there is a great confusion (from the semantic point of view) between NASH and NAFLD . Actually NASH is an histological diagnosis while NAFLD may be also not histological (clinical + liver US scan)... 2 Steatosis is frequently HCV related, mainly in case of HCV genotype 3. In some countries where HCV has great prevalence, NAFLD and HCV very frequently are present together and in these cases is very difficult to discriminate between NAFLD and HCV related steatosis... 3 Ludwig firstly described in 1980 NASH as present in not habitual drinkers, histologically indistinguishable from alcoholic injury. Really the cut-off of alcohol assumption that may be considered clinically not significant is a matter of debate: probably it is not the same for everyone and is different between men and women. In the literature of the past decades different cut-offs of alcohol assumption have been considered and this may be an important bias (some NASH might be actually ASH...)



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13721

Title: Transitions of histopathologic criteria for diagnosis of nonalcoholic fatty liver disease during the last three decades

Reviewer code: 00053433

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2014-08-29 16:58

Date reviewed: 2014-09-22 22:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting review aimed at providing a historical perspective on pathological features of NAFLD. The manuscript is well written and has scientific value since it includes a comprehensive compilation of articles on that relevant subject. COMMENTS 1. In the section on “pre-Ludwig era”, for the sake of completeness, I would suggest adding some discussion on the first comparisons of morphological characteristics between alcoholic fatty livers and fatty livers from diabetes or hepatotoxic drugs. 2. In the same section, it would be also very interesting to know more about the Japanese view on the issue (“...Japanese pioneer researchers investigated fatty liver disorders with keen observations and deep insights.”).