

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Pediatrics

ESPS manuscript NO: 17760

Title: Blunted perception of dyspnea and consequences for asthmatic children

Reviewer's code: 00741994

Reviewer's country: Netherlands

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-03-25 19:13

Date reviewed: 2015-04-08 17:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review is very concise and would benefit from some tables and figures to summarize patient characteristics, forced expiratory volume as a function of asthma symptom perception and survival curves. Specific comments: define FEV1 cite and discuss additional relevant papers such as Chen et al. Health psychology 2006;3:389-95.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Pediatrics

ESPS manuscript NO: 17760

Title: Blunted perception of dyspnea and consequences for asthmatic children

Reviewer's code: 00504181

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-03-25 19:13

Date reviewed: 2015-04-05 17:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an excellent commentary on the perception of dyspnea in asthmatic children, expanding on its ramifications for diagnosis and treatment. The article briefly summarizes the current state-of-the-art and alerts clinicians on potential pitfalls in the management of asthma in the pediatric population. Apart from minor language polishing, the article meets the high standards of the journal.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Pediatrics

ESPS manuscript NO: 17760

Title: Blunted perception of dyspnea and consequences for asthmatic children

Reviewer's code: 00742205

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-03-25 19:13

Date reviewed: 2015-03-25 21:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Sypnea is a subjective and hard to evaluate symptoms in children. The authors reviewed literature and demonstrated how unreliable the symptom is for clinical judgement. However, we need to consider a few problems in this question. [1] It tolerance to the dyspnea lead to more severe asthma attack? [2] Is psychological factor involved? [3] Is poor perception of dyspnea correlate with svere asthma? I do not think there is any study in these regards but the author clearly tell us that "do not use this symptom to judge how to treat asthmatic patients".