BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 11732
Title: Intestinal microbiota and type 2 diabetes: from mechanism insights to therapeutic perspective
Reviewer code: 01241484
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2014-06-03 15:02
Date reviewed: 2014-06-18 16:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] Existing	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper by Han and Lin, provide a revision of the bibliographic records regarding the link between intestinal microflora and type 2 diabetes. Although the topic in interesting, in respect to the identification of the potential role of the gut microbiota in human health, I have a number of major concerns. First, authors focused mainly in describing the reported differences between lean and obese and in many cases (page 4, first long paragraphs) just described what has been described in obese independently of whether the subjects developed diabetes type 2. Second, in other cases (page 5, lines 14-17) general concepts such as the implication of bile acids are described without any experimental direct linking with diabetes type 2. Third, the review looks more focus in obesity than in the disease. Note that not only obesity but other diseases or disorders may influence gut microbiota and in turns potential acquisition of diabetes type 2 and therefore focusing a review about diabetes mainly in obesity might not be appropriate. Important reference that has been published recently linking obesity and diabetes type 2 is missing: Gut Microbes. 2013 Jul-Aug;4(4):306-15

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 11732
Title: Intestinal microbiota and type 2 diabetes: from mechanism insights to therapeutic perspective
Reviewer code: 02822134
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2014-06-03 15:02
Date reviewed: 2014-07-09 04:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] Existing	[Y] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting review addressing the role of the microbiota in obsity and type 2 diabetes. Major comments: 1. although hepatic inflammation is mentioned, a brief alinea about steathosis /steathohepatitis is missing. 2. the beneficial effects of antibiotics are questionable. Already in 1955 it was shown that antibiotics induce weight gain (J Nutr 1955; 56: 151). 3. beneficial effects of probiotics are not proven, and this paragraph should be written with much more caution. For example, first sentence could be changed in: "An modulating effect of the gut microbiotia on type 2 DM was suggested by recent observations". second sentence: ...., may confer health benefits to the host. minor comments: -what are the physiological efefcts of GLP-2? -page 4: "Intestinal microbiota and energy homeostasis" could be changed in "Intestinal microbiota and body weight" which probably better reflects the content of this paragraph.

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 11732
Title: Intestinal microbiota and type 2 diabetes: from mechanism insights to therapeutic perspective
Reviewer code: 02731212
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2014-06-03 15:02
Date reviewed: 2014-07-09 19:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[Y] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] Existing	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an adequate review of the role of the microbiome in diabetes, insulin resistance, and obesity. It provides a useful summary of the more important studies in this area. The authors provide little in the way of synthesis or interpretation and the review would be more compelling and valuable if the authors strove to resolve discrepancies in the data and to provide specific mechanistic hypotheses that could be tested by further studies. (For example, why do ob/ob mice have reduced Bacteroidetes whereas diabetic humans have increased Bacteroidetes? What does this say about the potential role of Bacteroidetes in maintaining the ecology of the microbiome?) The language could be improved and there are numerous errors of spelling and grammar. In the abstract alone: "some obvious evidence," "feacel microbiota," "it is needed to take more studies."

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 11732
Title: Intestinal microbiota and type 2 diabetes: from mechanism insights to therapeutic perspective
Reviewer code: 00227589
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2014-06-03 15:02
Date reviewed: 2014-07-24 07:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Existing	[Y] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The submitted manuscript addresses an area of great interest and importance within the field of diabetes as well as in regards to the role the gut microbiome plays in health and disease. Overall the manuscript is well written and the authors incorporate many of the clinical studies that have been conducted in recent years. A few suggestions: - The authors should carefully look for grammar and diction issues. There are a few odd sentences that should be clarified. - In several places are the abbreviations mentioned before the entire word - please make appropriate changes when first mentioning a phrase that is later abbreviated - The authors mention the endocannabinoid system and CB1 receptors in the gut. CB2 receptors are present on immune cells - is there any information on their potential involvement? - The manuscript would benefit from a figure that illustrates the various effects that the gut microbiota may have on the development and maintenance of diabetes. It would be helpful to the reader to include a figure illustrating the discussed variables

BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 11732
Title: Intestinal microbiota and type 2 diabetes: from mechanism insights to therapeutic perspective
Reviewer code: 02907177
Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma
Date sent for review: 2014-06-03 15:02
Date reviewed: 2014-06-30 21:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[Y] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[Y] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] Existing	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

IT'S A NARRATIVE REVIEW, AND SHOULD BE A SYSTEMATIC REVIEW MANY KEYWORDS ARE NOT MESHS THERE ARE AT LEAST TWO PUBLICATIONS RECENTS AND SIMILAR TO YOUR: 1. Gomes AC, Bueno AA, de Souza RG, Mota JF. Gut microbiota, probiotics and diabetes. Nutr J 2014;13:60. [Epub ahead of print] PMID: 24939063. 2. Tilg H, Moschen AR. Microbiota and diabetes: an evolving relationship. Gut 2014 May 15. [Epub ahead of print] PubMed PMID: 24833634.