

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 52784

Title: Extended lymphadenectomy in hilar cholangiocarcinoma: What it will bring?

Reviewer's code: 02683307

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Doctor, Professor, Research Scientist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: South Korea

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-11-20

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-12-19 01:58

Reviewer performed review: 2019-12-26 10:34

Review time: 7 Days and 8 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript is well written.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 52784

Title: Extended lymphadenectomy in hilar cholangiocarcinoma: What it will bring?

Reviewer's code: 03388124

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Attending Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United States

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-11-20

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-02-29 00:09

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-06 19:25

Review time: 6 Days and 19 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is essentially a literature review on lymph node dissection in hilar cholangiocarcinoma. The preferred format would be either a meta-analysis, or based on the author's own experience. HCC is widely used to represent hepatocellular carcinoma, which is also within the purview of hepatobiliary surgeons. Thus, to avoid confusion, a different abbreviations should be chosen. Commonly used abbreviations for hilar cholangiocarcinoma include HC, hCCA, etc. It has been several years since the publication of AJCC 8th edition staging manual, thus the discussion should focus on AJCC 8th, rather than AJCC 7th. Although the pathologists and medical oncologists typically prefer more lymph nodes for accurate staging of any cancer, the surgeon has to balance other factors, e.g. the anatomic location, difficulty in removing more lymph nodes, intra-operative and long term complications associated with extensive lymph node dissection, etc. This should be discussed in the review as a separate section. The authors' conclusion of removing 15 lymph nodes for hilar cholangiocarcinoma appears to be too aggressive. Further justification is desired.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 52784

Title: Extended lymphadenectomy in hilar cholangiocarcinoma: What it will bring?

Reviewer's code: 03475479

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Lecturer

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2019-11-20

Reviewer chosen by: Jie Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-22 22:18

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-24 05:16

Review time: 1 Day and 6 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Authors reviewed about lymphadenectomy in hilar cholangiocarcinoma. This review was lacking in novelty but well-summarized. No16 LN metastasis is recognized as distant metastasis because of poor prognosis. For better survival in such cases, effective chemotherapy is essential not but resection. Authors should also discuss about chemotherapies for hilar cholangiocarcinoma with LN metastases. Authors partially used HCC as abbreviation of hilar cholangiocarcinoma. The abbreviation and full-spelling were both found. HCC was usually recognized as abbreviation of hepatocellular carcinoma I recommend HC, hilar CC or hICC as abbreviation of hilar cholangiocarcinoma.