



### PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 52784

**Title:** Extended lymphadenectomy in hilar cholangiocarcinoma: What it will bring?

**Reviewer's code:** 02683307

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Doctor, Professor, Research Scientist

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** South Korea

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2019-11-20

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jie Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-12-19 01:58

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-12-26 10:34

**Review time:** 7 Days and 8 Hours

|                                 |   |
|---------------------------------|---|
| <b>Scientific quality</b>       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good<br><input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish            |
| <b>Language quality</b>         | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing<br><input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection |
| <b>Conclusion</b>               | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority)<br><input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection             |
| <b>Re-review</b>                | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No  |
| <b>Peer-reviewer statements</b> | Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous<br>Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No   |

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

This manuscript is well written.



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 52784

**Title:** Extended lymphadenectomy in hilar cholangiocarcinoma: What it will bring?

**Reviewer’s code:** 03388124

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Associate Professor, Attending Doctor

**Reviewer’s Country/Territory:** United States

**Author’s Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2019-11-20

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jie Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-02-29 00:09

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-03-06 19:25

**Review time:** 6 Days and 19 Hours

|                                 |   |
|---------------------------------|---|
| <b>Scientific quality</b>       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good<br><input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish            |
| <b>Language quality</b>         | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing<br><input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection |
| <b>Conclusion</b>               | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority)<br><input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection             |
| <b>Re-review</b>                | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No  |
| <b>Peer-reviewer statements</b> | Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous<br>Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No   |

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

This is essentially a literature review on lymph node dissection in hilar cholangiocarcinoma. The preferred format would be either a meta-analysis, or based on the author's own experience. HCC is widely used to represent hepatocellular carcinoma, which is also within the purview of hepatobiliary surgeons. Thus, to avoid confusion, a different abbreviations should be chosen. Commonly used abbreviations for hilar cholangiocarcinoma include HC, hCCA, etc. It has been several years since the publication of AJCC 8th edition staging manual, thus the discussion should focus on AJCC 8th, rather than AJCC 7th. Although the pathologists and medical oncologists typically prefer more lymph nodes for accurate staging of any cancer, the surgeon has to balance other factors, e.g. the anatomic location, difficulty in removing more lymph nodes, intra-operative and long term complications associated with extensive lymph node dissection, etc. This should be discussed in the review as a separate section. The authors' conclusion of removing 15 lymph nodes for hilar cholangiocarcinoma appears to be too aggressive. Further justification is desired.



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 52784

**Title:** Extended lymphadenectomy in hilar cholangiocarcinoma: What it will bring?

**Reviewer's code:** 03475479

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Lecturer

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Japan

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2019-11-20

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jie Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2020-03-22 22:18

**Reviewer performed review:** 2020-03-24 05:16

**Review time:** 1 Day and 6 Hours

|                                 |   |
|---------------------------------|---|
| <b>Scientific quality</b>       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good<br><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish            |
| <b>Language quality</b>         | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing<br><input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection |
| <b>Conclusion</b>               | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority)<br><input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection             |
| <b>Re-review</b>                | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No  |
| <b>Peer-reviewer statements</b> | Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous<br>Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No   |

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

Authors reviewed about lymphadenectomy in hilar cholangiocarcinoma. This review was lacking in novelty but well-summarized. No16 LN metastasis is recognized as distant metastasis because of poor prognosis. For better survival in such cases, effective chemotherapy is essential not but resection. Authors should also discuss about chemotherapies for hilar cholangiocarcinoma with LN metastases. Authors partially used HCC as abbreviation of hilar cholangiocarcinoma. The abbreviation and full-spelling were both found. HCC was usually recognized as abbreviation of hepatocellular carcinoma I recommend HC, hilar CC or hICC as abbreviation of hilar cholangiocarcinoma.