

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 35002

Title: Balance control during gait initiation: State-of-the-art and research perspectives

Reviewer's code: 02444715

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-07-06

Date reviewed: 2017-07-06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review paper : Balance control during gait initiation is well written in a comprehensive way and clear but for an orthopaedic surgeon , I think it will need more illustrations starting from basic knowledge , to make the reader understand it with less effort

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 35002

Title: Balance control during gait initiation: State-of-the-art and research perspectives

Reviewer's code: 00505859

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-07-06

Date reviewed: 2017-07-07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Only a few grammatical corrections needed: 1. Abstract, 13th line, place "delineation" or "analysis" after "state-of-the-art" 2. Page 6, 5th line from bottom of paragraph, replace "important" with "significant"

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 35002

Title: Balance control during gait initiation: State-of-the-art and research perspectives

Reviewer's code: 02705018

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-07-06

Date reviewed: 2017-07-08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Although this submitted manuscript deals with an interesting topic, is written with a comprehensive style and inevitably its complex clinical meaning is difficult to be clearly understood by a non expert in this field Orthopaedic Surgeon. For this reason I beleive that it should be rewritten in a simpler way in order to be appropriate for publication in this journal.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 35002

Title: Balance control during gait initiation: State-of-the-art and research perspectives

Reviewer's code: 02703298

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-06-27

Date reviewed: 2017-07-10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[] Grade B: Very good	[] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[] The same title	[] High priority for publication
[] Grade C: Good	[] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[] Duplicate publication	[] Rejection
[] Grade D: Fair	[] Grade D: Rejected	[Y] No	[] Minor revision
[] Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	[] Major revision
		[] The same title	
		[] Duplicate publication	
		[] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I criticised the manuscript entitled "Balance control during gait initiation: state-of-the-art and research perspectives ". My review conclusion is as follows: The article is original and does provide significant and also detailed information about the balance control during gait initiation. Moreover, the grammar is excellent, so it easy to follow manuscript section. The narrative review was performed well. In view of the methodology, I did not provide additional specific comments.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 35002

Title: Balance control during gait initiation: State-of-the-art and research perspectives

Reviewer's code: 02281177

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-07-06

Date reviewed: 2017-07-12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting article. Balance control needs to integrate multiple sensory system information in CNS mainly including vestibular, visual, and proprioceptive inputs. Please authors add these.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 35002

Title: Balance control during gait initiation: State-of-the-art and research perspectives

Reviewer's code: 03069301

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-07-06

Date reviewed: 2017-07-12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present a very interesting paper by combining an update together with future directions for research. Unfortunately gait analysis, being a very important issue, receive little attention by orthopedic surgeons. That is particularly troublesome for understanding, by the way, the pathogenesis of hip fractures by those treating this very frequent traumatic disease. As the authors write in their paper, gait abnormalities are essential for hip fracture to happen, as well as some other skeletal traumatism. They have published many original papers on this subject and have expertise enough to appreciate why from time to time is good to produce a comprehensive publication.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

Manuscript NO: 35002

Title: Balance control during gait initiation: State-of-the-art and research perspectives

Reviewer's code: 02691156

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-07-06

Date reviewed: 2017-07-13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The submitted minireview manuscript proposes a state-of-the-art on (1) the balance control mechanisms in play during gait initiation in able bodied subjects and in the case of some frail populations and (2) the biomechanical parameters used in the literature to quantify dynamic stability. The title is referring directly to the problem at hand and the abstract unstructured, represent a synopsis of the main points of the present manuscript. Key words: are adequate. Introduction is clear and focuses on (1) the balance control mechanism in able subjects and in some frail populations and on (2) the biomechanical parameters used to quantify dynamic stability during gait initiation. Instead of Materials and Methods a number of subchapters are included with a detailed scientific analysis and discussion on the latest knowledge on the subject. Results are omitted and instead of Conclusions Concluding remarks are included emphasizing that "advances the viewpoint that dynamic stability during gait initiation (as measured with the margin of stability) may share a similar principle of functional regulation" and that further

research is needed to support their proposals. References are including 101 published papers to support authors' views, but without inclusion criteria. The submitted manuscript is a minireview aiming to provide readers with the latest knowledge and to help improve their diagnostic and therapeutic skills. In its present form, although possess valuable scientific information, is rather confusing the readers, who are falling within the various parameters of gait cycle, which are explained in details, but the manuscript, in the submitted form, diverge from AMRAD structure, needs to be reorganized in a better and clear way, for the common reader, before been accepted for publication.