



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25931

Title: Association between serum vitamin D levels and gastric cancer: A retrospective chart analysis

Reviewer’s code: 03475951

Reviewer’s country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-03-27 18:13

Date reviewed: 2016-03-29 01:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors examined retrospectively 49 gastric patients VitD levels. Though, their intention to find the relationship VitD deficiency and gastric cancer carcinogenesis is interesting, the small number of patients and retrospective design is not suitable to their aim. There are several critical issues to this paper. 1) Control: They selected 49 control patients without cancer and compared VitD level of these patients with gastric cancer patients. Though they mentioned that the control group matched the age and gender, their Demographic explanation of how to select these control patients are not sufficient. 2) Design: Retrospective design is not suitable. Gastric cancer can cause malnutrition. So I think the more prevalence of VitD insufficiency in gastric cancer patients is the result of gastric cancer rather than the cause of gastric cancer. At least, we cannot tell whether it is a cause or result with the retrospective design. 3) Demographic DATA: Among 3200 gastric cancer patients, they examined only 49 patients VitD level. So these patients could be a very biased group. The difference of demographic data including BMI of 49 patients and the other gastric cancer patients should be included. Consecutive analysis of VitD level for gastric cancer patients would be also helpful. 4)



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

Figures: Almost all the DATA in figures are also included in tables and easy to understand with only text. They should cut the redundant figures. 5) Discussion: They discuss general terms on gastric cancer in Discussion section a lot. They should discuss more specific topic on malnutrition of gastric cancer in the section.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25931

Title: Association between serum vitamin D levels and gastric cancer: A retrospective chart analysis

Reviewer's code: 02522148

Reviewer's country: South Korea

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-03-27 18:13

Date reviewed: 2016-04-05 22:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Major points: 1) Abstract describe concisely, not in a paragraph, the background, methodology, results, conclusion. 2) References should be numbered in the order cited; some references are not cited.. 3) Reference should be corrected in the style used in World J Gastrointestinal Oncol. Chen, W., et al. "Prospective study of serum 25 (OH)-vitamin D concentration and risk of oesophageal and gastric cancers." British journal of cancer 97.1 (2007): 123-128. > Chen W. Dawsey SM, Qiae YL Mark SD, Dong ZW, Taylor PR, Zhao P, Abnet CCl. Prospective study of serum 25 (OH)-vitamin D concentration and risk of oesophageal and gastric cancers. Br J Cancer.2007;97(1):123-128. Heaney, Robert P. "The vitamin D requirement in health and disease." The Journal of steroid biochemistry and molecular biology 97.1 (2005): 13-19. > Heaney RP. The vitamin D requirement in health and disease. J Steroid Biochem Mol Biol. 2005;97:13-19.



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25931

Title: Association between serum vitamin D levels and gastric cancer: A retrospective chart analysis

Reviewer's code: 03270562

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-03-27 18:13

Date reviewed: 2016-04-07 00:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Confidential Comments to Editor: The relationship between vitamin D and cancer has long been studied; however, the evidence of vitamin D deficiency with increased cancer risk remains insufficient and inconclusive except colorectal cancer. The study results of vitamin D and gastric cancer risk seems inconsistent and controversial so far. Some studies provided evidences excluding the hypotheses that vitamin D deficiency increases the risk of gastric cancer while others propose supplement of vitamin D for reducing gastric cancer risk and improving the prognoses of patients. Neil Vyas, et al performed a retrospective case-control study once again to determine whether there is an increased risk of gastric adenocarcinoma associated with vitamin D deficiency. The results indicate there is a positive correlation between vitamin D deficiency and gastric adenocarcinoma. The research design is reasonable, the data collection methods and statistical methods are adequate. The study provided reliable evidence of deficiency of vitamin D increases gastric cancer risk. The manuscript can help readers to understanding the important role of vitamin D in the pathogenesis of gastric cancer and improve clinical practice. However, the author should indicate the time of the



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

examination in the manuscript, for example, preoperative or postoperative or without any treatment, for it has long been observed that vitamin D deficiency is common in patients that underwent gastrectomy. References: 1. Garland C, Shekelle R B, Barrett-Connor E, et al. Dietary Vitamin D and calcium and risk of colorectal cancer: A 19 year prospective study in men.[J]. *Lancet*, 1(8424):307-309. 2. Davis C D. Vitamin D and cancer: current dilemmas and future research needs.[J]. *American Journal of Clinical Nutrition*, 2008, 88(88):565S-569S. 3. Abnet C C, Yu C, Wong-Ho C, et al. Circulating 25-hydroxyvitamin D and risk of esophageal and gastric cancer: Cohort Consortium Vitamin D Pooling Project of Rarer Cancers.[J]. *American Journal of Epidemiology*, 2010, 172(1):94-106. 4. Chen W, Dawsey S Y, Mark S, et al. Prospective study of serum 25(OH)-vitamin D concentration and risk of oesophageal and gastric cancers.[J]. *British Journal of Cancer*, 2007, 97(1):123-128. 5. Chao R, Qiu M Z, Wang D S, et al. Prognostic effects of 25-hydroxyvitamin D levels in gastric cancer.[J]. *Journal of Translational Medicine*, 2012, 10(2):188-200. 6. Manson J A E, Mayne S T, Clinton S K. Vitamin D and prevention of cancer-ready for prime time?[J]. *New England Journal of Medicine*, 2011, 364(15):1385-1387. 7. Lappe J M, Dianne T G, K Michael D, et al. Vitamin D and calcium supplementation reduces cancer risk: results of a randomized trial.[J]. *American Journal of Clinical Nutrition*, 2007, 85(6):1586-1591. 8. Albanes D. Vitamin D and Cancer: Diversity, Complexity, and Still a Ways to Go.[J]. *Cancer Prev Res (Phila)*.2015, V8N8: 657-661.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25931

Title: Association between serum vitamin D levels and gastric cancer: A retrospective chart analysis

Reviewer's code: 03270620

Reviewer's country: Poland

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-03-27 18:13

Date reviewed: 2016-04-13 18:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Gastric cancer is one of the most common cancer diseases in the world. The pathogenesis of this cancer is still not fully known. Worldwide studies/reviews still try to evaluate possible dependencies between genetics factors and gastric cancer development. The reviewed article fits in perfectly with the global trend. However, in my opinion article calls for minor changes before it will be accepted for print. 1) Name of bacteria should be written by italics in whole manuscript. 2) The manuscript requires edits. In many places (abstract, methods, results) appear to repeat the words.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25931

Title: Association between serum vitamin D levels and gastric cancer: A retrospective chart analysis

Reviewer's code: 03017210

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-03-27 18:13

Date reviewed: 2016-04-14 16:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is interesting that the Vit D deficiency is associated with gastric adenocarcinoma. Although it is a retrospective chart review, but it still provide us that Vit D deficiency is associated with gastric cancer.