

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4481

**Title:** Advanced hepatocellular carcinoma responds to MK615, a compound extract from the Japanese apricot “Prunus mume” .

**Reviewer code:** 02444877

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-07-02 15:06

**Date reviewed:** 2013-07-18 12:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Y] Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by Hoshino et al., aims to demonstrate the clinical efficacy of MK615, against HCC. In the present study authors have used MK615, a known anti tumor compound. MK615 contains triterpenoids, which are well known to suppress the growth of many cancer cell lines. The preliminary clinical trial conducted on six advanced HCC patients showed that MK165 exerts some notable effects on both lymph node and pulmonary metastasis. While the research makes a reasonable connection between the different earlier and present observations, the novelty of the work would have been much better with the support of some other important parameters. Though the study provides important preliminary findings, a number of critical issues have to be addressed before it can be considered for publication. ? Are there any clinical studies showing the use of this compound in countering progression of tumour in early stage of HCC or any other cancer, if so, those can be included in the introduction. ? Manuscript will be strengthened if the data on vitals of the participated subjects are included. ? Importantly, further studies are required to demonstrate the safety and efficacy, as the dosage administered in the present study is >12 g/day. ? As the present study was conducted on a small group of six numbers of patients it would have been much better if they have included more patients and studied additional clinical endpoints. Minor Comments ? In fig 3, label line graphs with the respective patient number ? There is repetition of statements in introduction and discussion. The author should carefully go through the manuscript and correct them. ? Abbreviations may be explained in MS, where it appeared first.

## ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Hepatology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 4481

**Title:** Advanced hepatocellular carcinoma responds to MK615, a compound extract from the Japanese apricot “Prunus mume” .

**Reviewer code:** 00006599

**Science editor:** Zhai, Huan-Huan

**Date sent for review:** 2013-07-02 15:06

**Date reviewed:** 2013-07-20 02:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I think this is an interesting case report that may open new space for further clinical trials.