



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5330

Title: Perspective on HBV-related HCC for reducing recurrence and improving survival

Reviewer code: 02444769

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-08-30 14:07

Date reviewed: 2013-09-19 22:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The author reviewed strategy and perspective on HBV-related HCC for reducing recurrence and improving survival after curative treatment (hepatic resection and radiofrequency ablation). In general the author provided information that might deepen our understanding of this field. But several major points need clarification before the manuscript could go to publication. Major points: Why there is no page-label? Title: The title should be modified to reflect several key words of this review: HBV-related HCC, anti-viral therapy, recurrence, survival. Definition of “curative treatment”: 1). In addition to resection and RFA (actually it is regional ablation therapy), the author should state clearly in the review that “curative treatment” includes transplantation, resection, regional ablation therapy (RFA, PEI, microwave, et al). Otherwise newcomers might get wrong concepts from this review. 2). To address this definition, author should be cautious of several citations that were actually “non-curative treatment”. For example, page-4, paragraph-1, line-8, ref-21, it is inappropriate to use “recurrence” to describe the efficacy of TACE. Stratification of early & late recurrence: as mentioned by the author, early recurrence (within 2 years) is mainly related to metastasis and dissemination of primary HCC, whereas late recurrence (after ≥ 2 years) mostly results from de novo tumors. So the question is, why author did not do stratification of early & late recurrence to see whether the effect of anti-viral therapy is work on early or late recurrence? By doing so, author could also answer the question that whether the effect of anti-viral therapy on survival is due to the prevention of recurrence or the progression of hepatitis and cirrhosis. Technically the author could at least give in the tables the follow-up length of each study to let readers to do justification. Minor points: Verbal improvement is needed. For example, page-5, paragraph-4, “At present, opinion is divided regarding whether administration of nucleic acid analogues after



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

HCC treatment prevents or does not prevent HCC recurrence.” Tables: should give what surgical treatment was applied in each study in the tables.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5330

Title: Perspective on HBV-related HCC for reducing recurrence and improving survival

Reviewer code: 00200281

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-08-30 14:07

Date reviewed: 2013-09-26 17:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

General comments In this manuscript the author proposes an interesting exposition about the state of art and about the future prospects on HBV related HCC recurrence, pathogenesis and therapy. Data discussed are very interesting, although they might be presented in a slightly better order, with some more reference and citations. Language revision is needed. Main strength: - Interesting subject - Future therapeutic options are discussed Main weakness: - not optimal English language. - Better organization required - Some more references should be added Abstract: Some short reference to the main topics discussed in the manuscript (role of HBV DNA load in cancer recurrences, main drugs discussed) should be added. Mechanism of antiviral drugs in preventing recurrent HCC-Nucleotide analogues preparations: In some of the sentences containing positive affirmation a reference should be given. I.e: “, “Nucleotide analogues treatment was able to improve survival post-HCC treatment compared with no nucleotide analogues therapy” and “patients with high viral loads at the time of HCC treatment who receive antiviral drugs show subsequent differences in HBV-DNA loads compared to those who do not receive such treatment”. Effects of IFN in preventing recurrence after curative treatment for HCC: As mentioned before, some sentences need a reference to be given, i.e: “Lamivudine after treatment of HCC may not prevent cancer recurrence, but may contribute to an improved prognosis by maintaining hepatic functional reserve”. Furthermore, some conditional tense should be introduced if the sentence discussed is actually still under debate. Conclusion: Some language revision might be needed and a few expressions could be rephrased. Specific comments I suggest to introduce some changes in the text and to improve the organization. Moreover some revision of the English language and some more reference should be introduced.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5330

Title: Perspective on HBV-related HCC for reducing recurrence and improving survival

Reviewer code: 00503560

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-08-30 14:07

Date reviewed: 2013-10-15 08:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript by Ishikawa et al., they reviewed the effect of anti-viral therapy on reducing recurrence and improving survival in patients with HBV-related HCC. The aim of this review is important, therefore this article is expected to be read by many physicians and investigators. The authors revised according to the reviewer's comments. However, there are several parts which they should revise. Minor comments 1) In page 2, line 11-12. The authors should correct to "nucleos(t)ide analogues (NA) may decrease HBV-DNA. So these drugs may decrease recurrence". 2) In page 3, line 18. The authors should correct "[15]" to "[15]". 3) In page 3, line 20. The authors should correct "nucleic acid analogues" to "NAs". 4) In page 4, line 23. The authors should describe the full spell of "AFP". 5) In page 5, line 7-13, "Kim et al ~". It is difficult to understand the sentences. Kim et al excluded the patients treated with anti-viral drugs. Therefore, the sentence "Kim et al analyzed the excluded patients using antiviral drugs" is wrong. 6) In page 5, line 17, and other parts. The authors should correct "Lamivudine" to "LVD". 7) In page 6, line 1. The authors should describe the full spell of "HBcrAg". 8) In page 7, line 9, and other parts. The authors should correct "entecavir" to "ETV". 9) In page 8, line 23 and 24. The authors should describe the full spells of "HBsAg" and "HBeAg".



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5330

Title: Perspective on HBV-related HCC for reducing recurrence and improving survival

Reviewer code: 01560575

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-08-30 14:07

Date reviewed: 2013-10-24 10:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The author of this manuscript intends to review a strategy for preventing recurrence of HBV-related HCC and improving survival of the patients using antiviral therapy including nucleotide analogues and IFNs. This manuscript needs extensive English polishing and editing for publication in WJG. Some examples of minor comments are described below. Minor comments 1. Page 1 (title page), line 4. Strategy of HBV-related HCC → Strategy for HBV-related HCC. 2. Page 2, line 4. 75%-80% → 75-80%. 3. Page 2, line 5. Is the predominant → is a predominant... 4. Page 2, line 9. HBV-DNA high viral loads → A high viral load of HBV-DNA is... 5. Page 2, line 11. May be decreased HBV-DNA → may decrease HBV-DNA. 6. Page 2, line 12. Be decreased recurrence → decrease recurrence. 7. Page 2, line 13. Speculated → described. 8. Page 2, line 24. Post treatment → post-treatment. 9. Page 3, line 10. 70%-80% → 70-80%. 10. Page 3, line 12. Against a → based on the. 11. Page 3, line 18. [→]. 12. Page 3, line 20. Nucleic acid analogues → NAs. 13. Page 3, line 22. Nucleic acid analogues → NAs. 14. Page 5, line 1. In another study by Xia et al. → Xia et al. 15. Page 5, line 8. Kim et al analyzed the excluded patients using.. → analyzed the excluded patients from using... 16. Page 5, line 17. Nucleotide analogues → NAs. 17. Page 6, line 3. "from" should be omitted. 18. Page 6, line 7. "seen" should be "compared" 19. Page 7, line 1. Nucleic acid analogues → NAs. 20. Page 7, line 3. Opinion is divided regarding → It is unclear that. 21. Page 7, line 11. "have" should be "has". 22. Page 7, line 15. Treatment for HCC → treatment of HCC. 23. In Reference section, there are two No. 19 and No. 20 references, respectively.