

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53151

Title: Silymarin, boswellic acid and curcumin enriched dietetic formulation reduces the growth of inherited intestinal polyps in an animal model

Reviewer's code: 03478148

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: DVM, DVSc

Professional title: Assistant Professor, Research Scientist

Reviewer's country: India

Author's country: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-10

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-12-11 03:55

Reviewer performed review: 2019-12-18 05:51

Review time: 7 Days and 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments: The study “SILYMARIN, BOSWELLIC ACID AND CURCUMIN ENRICHED DIETETIC FORMULATION REDUCES THE GROWTH OF INHERITED INTESTINAL POLYPS IN AN ANIMAL MODEL” is well designed and executed. However there are few points which need to be addressed: • How the dose of the formulation was decided as 22.4 mg/kg BW and the level of the compounds decided for the enriched diet? • The gross lesion image (Fig 1B) is not clear. Provide clear image with higher magnification and closer view of the intestinal lesion. • Fig 2 . Clarify the changes in the Microscopic image of intestine using arrows. • In Fig 3 only 48h image is presented. Provide the images for 72 and 96 hours to increase the clarity. • No or minimal inflammation is observed. However, inflammation is the feature of cancerous tissue. Justify? • No effect ER beta receptor. Need more clarification and justification. • Include most recent references in the manuscript and check for English editing.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

[Y] No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 53151

Title: Silymarin, boswellic acid and curcumin enriched dietetic formulation reduces the growth of inherited intestinal polyps in an animal model

Reviewer's code: 02732495

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Author's country: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2019-12-10

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-12-19 18:34

Reviewer performed review: 2019-12-21 22:06

Review time: 2 Days and 3 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this interesting experimental study, the authors aimed to assess the effects of a nutritional formulation with anti-carcinogenetic properties consisting of silymarin, boswellic acid and curcumin on preventing inherited intestinal cancer. They concluded that these nutrients posed a chemo-preventive synergic effect in inherited intestinal cancer as they stated that this effect might be mediated by the reduction of epithelial proliferation, the increase of apoptosis and the acceleration of villous cell renewal due to dietary formulation intake. The study is well designed and the manuscript is appropriately written. I congratulate the authors for their successful work.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No