

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5392

Title: Targeting of circulating hepatocellular carcinoma cells to prevent postoperative recurrence and metastasis

Reviewer code: 00225318

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-05 09:18

Date reviewed: 2013-09-08 23:53

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript of Yu Zhang et al is very interesting and topical. The revision is developed very efficiently and easy to read. The issue that is focused is of great interest. The only limitation is the lack of references to molecular methods for early detection of circulating tumor cells. An additional short section focused on this issue must be added at the end of the manuscript emphasizing the possible future development of this kind of methodology. In this section it could be analyzed such works as those of Pesta et al (Anticancer Res 2013, 33 (5) :2239-43, Pilatss Amm Surg Oncol 2012, 169 (2) :402-8 or Yao int Hepatobiliary Pancreatic Dis 2013, 12 (2) :171-9. this kind of information could enrich this study

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5392

Title: Targeting of circulating hepatocellular carcinoma cells to prevent postoperative recurrence and metastasis

Reviewer code: 00503546

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-05 09:18

Date reviewed: 2013-09-17 12:19

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | language polishing | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review article is instructive and includes suggestions of appropriate measures targeting circulating tumor cells which improve the therapeutic outcome of HCC. This report has enough potential for publication in this form, I think. Comments 1. [page 5, line 13] prognosis → prognosis

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5392

Title: Targeting of circulating hepatocellular carcinoma cells to prevent postoperative recurrence and metastasis

Reviewer code: 00012156

Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan

Date sent for review: 2013-09-05 09:18

Date reviewed: 2013-09-19 14:00

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|--|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | language polishing | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Zhang et al. described circulating hepatocellular carcinoma cell and recurrence of HCC. There were a only few referenced papers with relationship between circulating hepatocellular carcinoma cell and recurrence of HCC. Therefore, the contents of this paper had no evidence of their opinion. Story for read is interesting but not scientific. There is nothing new nor helpful for reader. Comments; There is no referenced paper that indicate the relationship between circulating hepatocellular carcinoma cell and recurrence of HCC. The recognition of circulating hepatocellular carcinoma cell and recurrence of HCC is different story, isn't it? Between p4-p11 there is no paper described on circulating hepatocellular carcinoma cell.