

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13065

Title: Negative depletion enrichment combined with identification using a combination of antibodies against hepatic-specific markers increases the sensitivity for circulating tumor cells in patients with hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer code: 00503125

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-08-04 11:01

Date reviewed: 2014-08-11 03:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript a double antibody screening technique was described to better detect circulating tumor cells in patients with hepatocellular carcinoma. In particular use of a single antibody often fails to detect certain circulating tumor cells since tumor cells do not uniformly express certain common tumor antigens. The results demonstrate an improved sensitivity for identifying circulating tumor cells upon use of an antibody cocktail for both asialoglycoprotein and carbamoyl phosphate synthetase 1.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13065

Title: Negative depletion enrichment combined with identification using a combination of antibodies against hepatic-specific markers increases the sensitivity for circulating tumor cells in patients with hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer code: 00111771

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-08-04 11:01

Date reviewed: 2014-08-04 13:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper is well written, clear and concise. The topic is interesting. The methods are sound. Conclusions are consistent with the results. Reserences are generally adequate: I would add some more comprehensive overview on the biological meaning and detection methods of circulating tumor cells such as "Circulating tumor cells: the 'leukemic phase' of solid cancers. Trends Mol Med 2006 Mar;12(3):130-9".

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13065

Title: Negative depletion enrichment combined with identification using a combination of antibodies against hepatic-specific markers increases the sensitivity for circulating tumor cells in patients with hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer code: 00051398

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-08-04 11:01

Date reviewed: 2014-08-15 20:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

refer to comments to editor

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13065

Title: Negative depletion enrichment combined with identification using a combination of antibodies against hepatic-specific markers increases the sensitivity for circulating tumor cells in patients with hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer code: 00503857

Science editor: Su-Xin Gou

Date sent for review: 2014-08-04 11:01

Date reviewed: 2014-08-13 21:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript, the authors described a new method of detecting circulating HCC tumor cells by using CD45 depletion of leucocytes+ antibody cocktail selection with ASGPR and CPS1. The idea of using this strategy is novel. However, I have a minor suggestion to this article. 1. In Table 2, six HCC patients were in stage I (T1N0M0, solitary tumor without vascular invasion). However, CTCs were detected in 3 out of 6 HCC patients in stage I. Please address more about this point. In my opinion, early detection of CTCs using this new strategy is promising.