

## ANNOUNCEMENT

# The article published in *WJG* 2005; 11(7): 931-937 partly duplicated an article previously published in *Critical Reviews in Eukaryotic Gene Expression* (2004; 14: 183-202)

### From the editor

On November 7, 2007, we received an E-mail from He Zhi-Gang ([hezhang@gmail.com](mailto:hezhang@gmail.com)) reporting a case of duplicate publication. After our evaluation we are able to confirm this claim. The details are noted below.

© 2008 WJG. All rights reserved.

The article published in *WJG* 2005; 11(7): 931-937 partly duplicated an article previously published in *Critical Reviews in Eukaryotic Gene Expression* (2004; 14: 183-202). *World J Gastroenterol* 2008; 14(9): 1470-1471 Available from: URL: <http://www.wjgnet.com/1007-9327/14/1470.asp>

### E-MAIL CONTENT OF CLAIMANT (TRANSLATED)

#### Respected editors

The article published in *World Journal of Gastroenterology (WJG)* Volume 11 Issue 7 (pages 931 to 937) by Ting-Ting Li *et al* in 2005 plagiarized an article appearing in *Critical Reviews in Eukaryotic Gene Expression (CREGE)* (Volume 14 Issue 3, pages 183 to 202, 2004). The attached two files are copies of both articles, with the plagiarized part highlighted in yellow. Zhi-Gang He.

### DETAILS OF DUPLICATE PUBLICATION

#### Different patterns of duplicate publication

Ting-Ting Li, Li-Na Zhao, Zhi-Guo Liu, Ying Han, Dai-Ming Fan, Institute of Gastroenterology, Xijing Hospital, Fourth Military Medical University, Xi'an 710032, Shaanxi Province, China

Supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China, No. 30400016; the Elite Program of FMMU, No. 4138A4324; and the Major State Basic Research Development Program of China (973 Program), No. 2004CB518702.

Co-first-authors: Ting-Ting Li and Li-Na Zhao

Correspondence to: Zhi-Guo Liu, M.D., Ph.D., Institute of Gastroenterology, 15 West Changle Road, Xijing Hospital Xi'an 710032, Shaanxi Province, China. [liuzhiguo@fmmu.edu.cn](mailto:liuzhiguo@fmmu.edu.cn)

Telephone: +86-29-83375229 Fax: +86-29-82539041

Received: 2004-07-23

Accepted: 2004-10-20

Li TT, Zhao LN, Liu ZG, Han Y, Fan DM. Regulation of apoptosis by the papillomavirus E6 oncogene. *World J Gastroenterol*. 2005 Feb 21; 11(7): 931-937. Review. PMID: 15742391 [PubMed-indexed for MEDLINE]

<http://www.wjgnet.com/1007-9327/11/931.asp>

### An already published article

Xueli Fan, Jason J Chen, Department of Medicine, University of Massachusetts Medical School, 364 Plantation Street, Worcester, MA 01605-2324, United States. [jason.chen@umassmed.edu](mailto:jason.chen@umassmed.edu)

Fan X, Chen JJ. Regulation of cell cycle progression and apoptosis by the papillomavirus E6 oncogene. *Crit Rev Eukaryot Gene Expr*. 2004; 14(3): 183-202. Review. PMID: 15248815 [PubMed-indexed for MEDLINE]

### ANALYSIS OF DUPLICATED MANUSCRIPT

Both manuscripts are reviews on the molecular basis for E6-induced cell proliferation and apoptosis, and most parts of the article published by *WJG* are exact copies of the manuscript published by *CREGE*, without acknowledgment, and including the same sentences, words and even punctuation marks. The yellow highlighted parts in Figure 1 show the highly similar parts in the article published by *WJG*.

Based on this analysis, *WJG* considers this a typical case of duplicate publication, and is prepared to take strict, appropriate action against such behavior.

### LETTER FROM THE AUTHOR

Dear Editor,

Here I appreciate you can give me an opportunity to explain this.

I once worked in Jason Chen's lab. This review was invited by *Critical Reviews in Eukaryotic Gene Expression (CREGE)*. At that time, he asked me to write the apoptosis part, and promised me a first author. Therefore I compiled this review and the manuscript was submitted. After that I didn't get any information on whether or not it has been accepted or not. After I came back from US, there is some unhappy personal issues happened between Jason Chen and me. He threatened to remove my name in the manuscript, but because considering this review is a personal intellectual product, not experiment related, I told him that I had the right to publish it myself. After that the revised paper was submitted to *WJG* and published.

Please refer to the following emails from Editor of *CREGE* for details about the manuscript. There are two points which can be concluded from the following information: The first, I was enlisted as the first author even at TOC of the print copy; the second, Jason Chen asked the editor to remove my name without my permission.

I consider the fact is that Jason Chen neglected my



**Figure 1** Snapshot of manuscript (7 pages total) published by *WJG*. The yellow parts were copied directly from the manuscript published by *CREGE*.

contribution and published my intellectual product without my permission.

Please contact Editor of *CREGE* for confirmation. If you do want to publish the attached pdf announcements, I would appreciate you can add the information supplied in this email.

I will be willing to be of any further assistance.

Zhiguo Liu  
2008-02-01

#### **Letter from Zhi-Guo Liu to Vicky Lipowski**

Dear Mattew Friedman or the person in charge,  
On the journal of Critical Reviews in Eukaryotic Gene Expression published in 2004 volume 14(3), there is a paper published entitled Regulation of cell cycle progression and apoptosis by the papillomavirus E6 oncogene (page 183-202). I was the first author during the submission. But I found my name is not in the author list of the final paper. Would you like to check it out for me what happened? Is it a mistake or something else? I would really appreciate your help. Thanks. If you are not the person in charge of this issue, can you forward this email to the person I should talk to?

Have a nice day.

Zhiguo Liu, MD, Ph D  
Institute of Gastroenterology  
Xijing Hospital, FMMU  
17 West Changle Road  
Xi'an China 710032  
Tel: 86-139 0926 8719  
Fax: 86-29 8253 9041  
Email: liuzhiguo@fmmu.edu.cn

#### **Reply 1**

Dear Dr Liu,  
I am checking the error that occurred in CRE 1403. I see that

you are listed in the TOC of the print copy but not with the article. In the meantime I will have the files corrected and update the website as soon as possible. I sincerely apologize for this error and thank you for bringing this to my attention.

Vicky Lipowski  
Production Manager

#### **Reply 2**

Dear Prof Liu,  
Upon looking further into your request concerning the article "Regulation of cell cycle progression and apoptosis by the papillomavirus E6 oncogene (CRE 1403-page 183-202)", I have been informed that the corresponding author felt it was appropriate to move your name from the author list to the acknowledgement section. If you wish to pursue this further you will need to contact Professor Chen. Unfortunately, I cannot correct or issue an erratum without the consent of the corresponding author.

Vicky Lipowski  
Production Manager  
Begell House Inc  
145 Madison Ave  
New York, New York 10016  
1-212-725-1999  
vicky@begellhouse.com

#### **Letter from Jason J Chen to WJG editor**

Dear Editor,  
I appreciate the courage of you and He Zhi-Gang to bring up the issue, although my self has long been decided not to pursue it further because I think Zhiguo Liu is a talented physician scientist and should have the opportunity to continue his research. Zhiguo Liu was indeed listed as the first author at beginning. His name was included as a bonus mainly for his work in the laboratory, although his contribution to the manuscript may not be sufficient as an author. Once he was no longer deserved the first authorship, his name was moved to the third position. After he refused to accept the arrangement, his name was moved from the author list to acknowledgement. He was notified about these arrangements.

The only contribution Zhiguo Liu made to the review article was preparation of figures under my guidance. BTW, we did not use his figures for the final version of the article. He did not write the apoptosis part or anything else for the review article. Careful readers should be able to compare the article with my previous review article [Biochimica et Biophysica Acta 1378 (1998) F1-F19] as well as the non-duplicated part of the *WJG* article for consistency of style.

I noticed that you have changed the word "plagiarize" in the previous version of the announcement to "duplicate" in the current announcement. This is fine with me. It is my fault to have listed him as the first author at the first place and it is awkward to switch the authorship afterwards. I believe we all learnt a lesson from this incident. It is my hope that we leave this behind, let the readers make their own judgments, and move forward.

Jason J Chen  
2008-03-01