

# 91011\_Auto\_Edited-check.docx

**Mindfulness training in medical education as a means to improve resilience, empathy, and mental health in the medical profession**

Vidal EIO *et al.* Mindfulness in medical education

Edison Iglesias de Oliveira Vidal, Luiz Fernando Alvarenga Ribeiro, Marco Antonio de Carvalho-Filho, Fernanda Bono Fukushima

**Abstract**

The high rates of depression, burnout, and increased risk of suicide among medical students, residents, and physicians in comparison with other careers signal a mental health crisis within our profession. We contend that this crisis coupled with the inadequate acquisition of interpersonal skills during medical education results from the interaction between a challenging environment and the mental capital of individuals. Additionally, we posit that mindfulness-based practices are instrumental for the development of major components of mental capital, such as resilience, flexibility of mind, and learning skills, while also serving as a pathway to enhance empathy, compassion, self-awareness, conflict resolution, and relational abilities. Importantly, the evidence base supporting the effectiveness of mindfulness-based interventions has been increasing over the years, and a growing number of medical schools have already integrated mindfulness into their curricula. While we acknowledge that mindfulness is not a panacea for all educational and mental health problems in this field, we argue that there is currently an unprecedented opportunity to gather momentum, spread and study mindfulness-based programs in medical schools around the world as a way to address

some longstanding shortcomings of the medical profession and the health and educational systems upon which it is rooted.

**Key Words:** Mindfulness; Medical education; Mental capital; Mental health; Medical students; Resilience

Vidal EIO, Ribeiro LFA, Carvalho-Filho MA, Fukushima FB. Mindfulness training in medical education as a means to improve resilience, empathy, and mental health in the medical profession. *World J Psychiatry* 2024; In press

**Core Tip:** High rates of depression, burnout, and suicide risk among medical professionals highlight a mental health crisis. We propose that mindfulness-based practices can enhance mental capital, fostering resilience, flexibility, and learning skills. Mindfulness also promotes empathy, compassion, self-awareness, conflict resolution, and relational abilities. Increasing evidence supports the effectiveness of mindfulness interventions, prompting many medical schools to integrate them into curricula. While not a panacea, mindfulness offers a promising opportunity to address longstanding issues in the medical profession and associated health and educational systems.

## **INTRODUCTION**

By the end of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, there was a consensus that medical education should transition its focus from the memorization of factual material to the cultivation of life-long learning skills in students<sup>[1-3]</sup>. Rather than learning something once and for all, students were expected to acquire the ability to continually update their knowledge. Medical schools were tasked to equip students with the means and skills to foster such attitudes. This shift in perception arose in response to the geometric growth and increased accessibility of information within the field of medicine.

Interestingly, this evolution in medical education did not witness a parallel transformation in the acquisition of relational and conflict-solving skills<sup>[4-6]</sup>. While

medical schools adapted to the changing landscape of information delivery, the emphasis on relational skills did not experience a comparable shift within formal curricula. However, most physicians would probably agree that acquiring proficiency in relational skills with patients, peers, and other healthcare professionals is far more complex than mastering factual information or technical procedures<sup>[7]</sup>. Compounding this challenge is the consistent evidence showing a decline in empathy among medical students and residents as they progress through their education<sup>[8]</sup>. This decline not only hampers their ability to understand the patient's perspective but also impacts their competence in working within inter-professional teams, potentially contributing to the development of disruptive behavior — an increasingly recognized source of avoidable medical errors and harm to patients<sup>[9]</sup>.

Shapiro and colleagues proposed a definition of professionalism as “any intent, action, or words that foster trustworthy relationships”<sup>[10]</sup>. Teaching relational skills that foster such relationships remains at the same time the Achilles’ heel and Holy Grail of modern medical education<sup>[11,12]</sup>. Most experts in this field attribute the challenge of nurturing professionalism in medical students to problems associated with the hidden curriculum of healthcare organizations<sup>[13-15]</sup>. The hidden curriculum represents <sup>3</sup> the learning derived from the organizational and cultural environment of healthcare institutions<sup>[16]</sup>. It comprises unspoken, taken-for-granted rules and customs that impart vehement lessons about what is and what is not important, acceptable, or desirable in medicine on a daily basis. Even in the unlikely scenario where medical schools dedicated one thousand hours of their formal curricula to teach professionalism to their students, there would still be a significant risk of failure due to the strong influence of unprofessional examples available in every medical school’s hidden curriculum.

A few institutions such as <sup>1</sup> Brigham and Women’s Hospital, Mount Sinai Medical Center, the University of Pennsylvania Health System, the University of Washington School of Medicine, and Vanderbilt University School of Medicine deserve praise for their efforts in addressing the problem of unprofessional behavior within their hidden curricula. Most of these initiatives involved the establishment <sup>1</sup> of an institutional code of

professional conduct and a centralized reporting and management structure for professionalism-related concerns<sup>[17]</sup>.

While such approaches are extremely important, we contend that they are insufficient to change the landscape of declining empathy and other relational abilities within medical education. Our main argument lies in the fact that the inappropriate acquisition - alas deterioration - of interpersonal skills results from the interaction of a challenging environment and the individual mental capital of medical students. By 'environment' we mean not only matters associated with the hidden curriculum but also every experience, positive and negative, students go through during their training. The very nature of medical learning inevitably involves experiencing stress, suffering, pain, loss, and several other challenging situations such as sleep deprivation, heavy study/workload, and responsibility in caring for patients with serious illnesses. By individual 'mental capital', we refer to both cognitive and emotional resources, encompassing learning abilities, mental flexibility, emotional intelligence, social skills, and resilience in the face of stressful situations, as defined by an influential report from the Foresight Program of the UK Government Office for Science<sup>[18]</sup>. Our argument is supported by a recent systematic review of predictors of empathy and compassion among medical students, which included 222 studies<sup>[19]</sup>. On the one hand, that review revealed that empathy and compassion are negatively associated with factors such as heavy workloads, hierarchical work environments, 'assembly-line' organizational culture, and an educational ethos prioritizing the acquisition of knowledge and academic achievement. On the other hand, that review also found evidence that empathy and compassion were positively correlated with individual characteristics of students, such as emotional intelligence, openness, perspective-taking, and reflexive skills.

If medical schools are indeed committed to changing the picture of declining empathy described above, in addition to addressing their hidden curricula, they should strive to nurture their students' capabilities to cope with adverse and stressful milieus. But what kinds of initiatives have evidence as a means to increase empathy, compassion, self-awareness, stress coping, conflict-solving, and relational abilities?

We posit that mindfulness-based practices offer a way to foster such competencies. Mindfulness has been defined as “the awareness that emerges through paying attention on purpose, in the present moment, and nonjudgmentally to the unfolding of experience moment by moment”<sup>[20]</sup>. It is an innate ability that can be enhanced by training in several formal and informal mindfulness techniques. These methods originate from ancient oriental contemplative traditions, especially Buddhism, and were systematized by John Kabat-Zinn in 1979 into a program called Mindfulness-Based Stress Reduction. That program did not aim to teach Buddhism or any kind of religious ideology; instead, it intended to instruct patients, who were not responding to usual medical treatments, in meditative methods to cope and relieve physical and psychic suffering. The program served as a model for a wide range of mindfulness-based initiatives in various fields such as the military, sports, business corporations, education, and healthcare. In the United Kingdom, an all-party parliamentary group conducted an inquiry into the potential of mindfulness-based practices in the domains of health care, education, workplaces, and the criminal system. In its final report, they argued that mindfulness is instrumental for the development of major components of mental capital, such as resilience, flexibility of mind, and learning skills<sup>[21]</sup>. In addition, they recommended various forms of support for mindfulness-based initiatives in those key areas. Importantly, those recommendations were framed upon the understanding that the United Kingdom is facing a major mental health crisis, with increasing effects of depression, anxiety, and stress on its population, and alternative approaches are urgently needed to address it. We contend that the high rates of depression, burnout, and increased risk of suicide among medical students, residents, and physicians in comparison with other careers also point to the existence of a mental health crisis within our profession<sup>[22-25]</sup>. For example, according to <sup>7</sup>the Australian National Mental Health Survey of Doctors and Medical Students, which included over 14000 participants, 24.8% of doctors had thoughts of suicide in comparison to 13.3% of the general population and 12.8% of other professionals<sup>[26]</sup>.

The evidence base around the effectiveness of mindfulness-based interventions has been growing over the years. A review about mindfulness-based programs in medical



education concluded that despite the different designs of those programs, their results were uniformly positive among medical students and healthcare professionals and involved increases in empathy, self-compassion, and ability to focus, as well as decreases stress, anxiety, and depressive symptoms<sup>[27]</sup>. Another recent systematic review focused exclusively on the effectiveness of mindfulness-based interventions on empathy in healthy populations and included 12 randomized clinical trials and one quasi-experimental study<sup>[28]</sup>. Its meta-analysis found a statistically significant positive standardized mean difference of 0.37 (95% CI: 0.16 to 0.58) favoring the mindfulness-based interventions in improving empathy levels in comparison to controls. Importantly, seven out of the 13 studies included in that review focused on subjects in medical-related occupations, and four of them on medical students. Similarly, a meta-analysis of the most comprehensive systematic review conducted to date about the effectiveness of mindfulness-based interventions on stress levels in medical students found a pooled standardized mean difference of 0.37 (95% CI: 0.24 to 0.50) favoring the mindfulness arm, in 18 studies<sup>[29]</sup>. In addition, a recent scoping review of mindfulness training for undergraduate health and social care students highlighted that, besides its positive effects on stress levels, those interventions were associated with improved student self-awareness, ability to attend to patients, peer cohesion, and group support, as well as student insights into the culture of health and social education<sup>[30]</sup>. Furthermore, it seems relevant to highlight that there is some initial evidence that there may be long-term benefits of mindfulness interventions among students. A randomized controlled trial of a 15-h mindfulness-based stress reduction intervention performed over seven weeks among 288 undergraduate medical and psychology students was associated with improved well-being and coping patterns up to six years after the intervention<sup>[31]</sup>. Lastly, a recent realist review of mindfulness-based interventions in a variety of workplaces, including 75 studies, suggested that the mechanisms behind the positive effects of those interventions involved awareness/self-regulation, acceptance/compassion, a sense of growth, feeling permitted to take care of oneself, and the promise of goal attainment<sup>[32]</sup>.

Importantly, that review also emphasized the paramount role of a supportive environment in realizing the positive effects of mindfulness-based interventions.

As to the pathophysiological mechanisms underlying the effects of mindfulness-based practices, there is some evidence from the neuroscience field indicating that they are <sup>2</sup> associated with neuroplastic changes in the insula, amygdala, anterior cingulate cortex, fronto-limbic network, temporo-parietal junction, and default mode network. These structures are related to the regulation of attention and emotion and change in perspective on self<sup>[33,34]</sup>.

Finally, it is important to acknowledge that mindfulness-based practices had already made their first steps in medical education decades ago<sup>[27]</sup>. The University of Massachusetts Medical School has been offering <sup>2</sup> a mindfulness-based stress reduction program for its students as part of its curriculum since 1985. Monash University in Australia integrated a mindfulness program into its core curriculum for all medical students in 2002 and expanded it into other faculties such as Engineering, Law, and Psychology. Importantly, a 2014 survey found that 43 out of <sup>5</sup> 140 medical schools accredited by the Association of American Medical Colleges in the US had mindfulness integrated into their curricula<sup>[35]</sup>.

## **CONCLUSION**

The arguments described above do not imply that all questions about mindfulness practices and their role in medical education have been solved, nor that they are a mystic solution for all educational and mental health problems in this field. Instead, they highlight the current unprecedented opportunity to gather momentum, spread, and study mindfulness-based programs in medical schools around the world as a way to address some longstanding shortcomings of the medical profession and the health and educational systems upon which it is rooted.

## **REFERENCES**



- 1 **Dunlap JC**, Grabinger S. Preparing Students for Lifelong Learning: A Review of Instructional Features and Teaching Methodologies. *Perform Improv Q* 2003; **16**: 6-25 [DOI: 10.1111/j.1937-8327.2003.tb00276.x]
- 2 **Rubin P**, Franchi-Christopher D. New edition of Tomorrow's Doctors. *Med Teach* 2002; **24**: 368-369 [PMID: 12193317 DOI: 10.1080/0142159021000000816]
- 3 **Schrock JW**, Cydulka RK. Lifelong learning. *Emerg Med Clin North Am* 2006; **24**: 785-795 [PMID: 16877143 DOI: 10.1016/j.emc.2006.05.012]
- 4 **Csörsz I**, Molnar P, Csabai M. Medical students on the stage: an experimental performative method for the development of relational skills. *Med Teach* 2011; **33**: e489-e494 [PMID: 21854143 DOI: 10.3109/0142159X.2011.599449]
- 5 **Carraccio CL**, Englander R. From Flexner to competencies: reflections on a decade and the journey ahead. *Acad Med* 2013; **88**: 1067-1073 [PMID: 23807096 DOI: 10.1097/ACM.0b013e318299396f]
- 6 **Frenk J**, Chen L, Bhutta ZA, Cohen J, Crisp N, Evans T, Fineberg H, Garcia P, Ke Y, Kelley P, Kistnasamy B, Meleis A, Naylor D, Pablos-Mendez A, Reddy S, Scrimshaw S, Sepulveda J, Serwadda D, Zurayk H. Health professionals for a new century: transforming education to strengthen health systems in an interdependent world. *Lancet* 2010; **376**: 1923-1958 [PMID: 21112623 DOI: 10.1016/S0140-6736(10)61854-5]
- 7 **Barbosa ACN**, Duarte BKL, Carvalho-Filho MA, De Paula EV. From residency training to professional life: which competencies and skills are most valued by haematologists in Brazil? *Lancet Haematol* 2022; **9**: e95-e96 [PMID: 35114161 DOI: 10.1016/S2352-3026(22)00005-9]
- 8 **Neumann M**, Edelhäuser F, Tauschel D, Fischer MR, Wirtz M, Woopen C, Haramati A, Scheffer C. Empathy decline and its reasons: a systematic review of studies with medical students and residents. *Acad Med* 2011; **86**: 996-1009 [PMID: 21670661 DOI: 10.1097/ACM.0b013e318221e615]
- 9 **Sanchez LT**. Disruptive behaviors among physicians. *JAMA* 2014; **312**: 2209-2210 [PMID: 25144182 DOI: 10.1001/jama.2014.10218]

- 10 **Shapiro J**, Whittemore A, Tsen LC. Instituting a culture of professionalism: the establishment of a center for professionalism and peer support. *Jt Comm J Qual Patient Saf* 2014; **40**: 168-177 [PMID: 24864525 DOI: 10.1016/S1553-7250(14)40022-9]
- 11 **Buyx AM**, Maxwell B, Schöne-Seifert B. Challenges of educating for medical professionalism: who should step up to the line? *Med Educ* 2008; **42**: 758-764 [PMID: 18564097 DOI: 10.1111/j.1365-2923.2008.03112.x]
- 12 **Morreale MK**, Balon R, Louie AK, Guerrero APS, Aggarwal R, Coverdale J, Beresin EV, Brenner AM. The Vital Importance of Professionalism in Medical Education. *Acad Psychiatry* 2023; **47**: 340-343 [PMID: 37548858 DOI: 10.1007/s40596-023-01840-3]
- 13 **Goldstein EA**, Maestas RR, Fryer-Edwards K, Wenrich MD, Oelschlager AM, Baernstein A, Kimball HR. Professionalism in medical education: an institutional challenge. *Acad Med* 2006; **81**: 871-876 [PMID: 16985343 DOI: 10.1097/01.ACM.0000238199.37217.68]
- 14 **Gaiser RR**. The teaching of professionalism during residency: why it is failing and a suggestion to improve its success. *Anesth Analg* 2009; **108**: 948-954 [PMID: 19224808 DOI: 10.1213/ane.0b013e3181935ac1]
- 15 **Silveira GL**, Campos LKS, Schweller M, Turato ER, Helmich E, de Carvalho-Filho MA. "Speed up"! The Influences of the Hidden Curriculum on the Professional Identity Development of Medical Students. *Health Prof Educ* 2019; **5**: 198-209 [DOI: 10.1016/j.hpe.2018.07.003]
- 16 **Hafferty FW**. Beyond curriculum reform: confronting medicine's hidden curriculum. *Acad Med* 1998; **73**: 403-407 [PMID: 9580717 DOI: 10.1097/00001888-199804000-00013]
- 17 **de Oliveira Vidal EI**, Silva Vdos S, Santos MF, Jacinto AF, Boas PJ, Fukushima FB. Why medical schools are tolerant of unethical behavior. *Ann Fam Med* 2015; **13**: 176-180 [PMID: 25755040 DOI: 10.1370/afm.1763]
- 18 **UK Government Office for Science**. Mental capital and wellbeing: Making the most of ourselves in the 21st century. 2008 [DOI:10.1037/e592742011-001]

- 19 **Wang CXY**, Pavlova A, Boggiss AL, O'Callaghan A, Consedine NS. Predictors of Medical Students' Compassion and Related Constructs: A Systematic Review. *Teach Learn Med* 2023; **35**: 502-513 [PMID: 35930256 DOI: 10.1080/10401334.2022.2103816]
- 20 **Kabat-Zinn J**. Mindfulness-Based Interventions in Context: Past, Present, and Future. *Clin Psychol Sci Pract* 2003; **10**: 144-156 [DOI: 10.1093/clipsy.bpg016]
- 21 **Mindfulness All-Party Parliamentary Group**. Mindful Nation UK report. Available from: <https://www.themindfulnessinitiative.org/mindful-nation-report>
- 22 **Schwenk TL**. Resident Depression: The Tip of a Graduate Medical Education Iceberg. *JAMA* 2015; **314**: 2357-2358 [PMID: 26647255 DOI: 10.1001/jama.2015.15408]
- 23 **Reyes C**, Santana V, Arocha G, Martínez N, Almonte K. Prevalence of depressive symptoms and suicide risk among medical residents. *Eur Psychiatry* 2022; **65**: 552-552 [DOI: 10.1192/j.eurpsy.2022.1412]
- 24 **Liétor M**, Cuevas I, Prieto M. Suicidal behaviour in medicine students and residents. *Eur Psychiatry* 2021; **64**: 581-581 [DOI: 10.1192/j.eurpsy.2021.1551]
- 25 **Devi S**. Doctors in distress. *Lancet* 2011; **377**: 454-455 [PMID: 21300592 DOI: 10.1016/S0140-6736(11)60145-1]
- 26 National Mental Health Survey of Doctors and Medical Students. Available from: <https://medicine.uq.edu.au/files/42088/Beyondblue%20Doctors%20Mental%20health.pdf>
- 27 **Dobkin PL**, Hutchinson TA. Teaching mindfulness in medical school: where are we now and where are we going? *Med Educ* 2013; **47**: 768-779 [PMID: 23837423 DOI: 10.1111/medu.12200]
- 28 **Hu Z**, Wen Y, Wang Y, Lin Y, Shi J, Yu Z, Lin Y, Wang Y. Effectiveness of mindfulness-based interventions on empathy: A meta-analysis. *Front Psychol* 2022; **13**: 992575. [PMID: 36337535 DOI: 10.3389/fpsyg.2022.992575]
- 29 **Sperling EL**, Hulett JM, Sherwin LB, Thompson S, Bettencourt BA. The effect of mindfulness interventions on stress in medical students: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *PLoS One* 2023; **18**: e0286387 [PMID: 37796866 DOI: 10.1371/journal.pone.0286387]

- 30 **Crowther LL**, Robertson N, Anderson ES. Mindfulness for undergraduate health and social care professional students: Findings from a qualitative scoping review using the 3P model. *Med Educ* 2020; **54**: 796-810 [PMID: 32163615 DOI: 10.1111/medu.14150]
- 31 **de Vibe M**, Solhaug I, Rosenvinge JH, Tyssen R, Hanley A, Garland E. Six-year positive effects of a mindfulness-based intervention on mindfulness, coping and well-being in medical and psychology students; Results from a randomized controlled trial. *PLoS One* 2018; **13**: e0196053 [PMID: 29689081 DOI: 10.1371/journal.pone.0196053]
- 32 **Micklitz K**, Wong G, Howick J. Mindfulness-based programmes to reduce stress and enhance well-being at work: a realist review. *BMJ Open* 2021; **11**: e043525. [PMID: 33741667 DOI: 10.1136/bmjopen-2020-043525]
- 33 **Hölzel BK**, Lazar SW, Gard T, Schuman-Olivier Z, Vago DR, Ott U. How Does Mindfulness Meditation Work? Proposing Mechanisms of Action From a Conceptual and Neural Perspective. *Perspect Psychol Sci* 2011; **6**: 537-559 [PMID: 26168376 DOI: 10.1177/1745691611419671]
- 34 **Diez GG**, Castellanos N. [Investigacion de mindfulness en neurociencia cognitiva]. *Rev Neurol* 2022; **74**: 163-169 [PMID: 35211950 DOI: 10.33588/rn.7405.2021014]
- 35 **Barnes N**, Hattan P, Black DS, Schuman-Olivier Z. An Examination of Mindfulness-Based Programs in US Medical Schools. *Mindfulness* 2017; **8**: 489-494 [DOI: 10.1007/s12671-016-0623-8]

## Footnotes

**Conflict-of-interest statement:** All the authors report no relevant conflicts of interest for this article.

**Open-Access:** This article is an open-access article that was selected by an in-house editor and fully peer-reviewed by external reviewers. It is distributed in accordance with the Creative Commons Attribution NonCommercial (CC BY-NC 4.0) license, which permits others to distribute, remix, adapt, build upon this work non-commercially, and license their derivative works on different terms, provided the original work is properly cited and the use is non-commercial. See: <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>

**Provenance and peer review:** Invited article; Externally peer reviewed.

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Peer-review started:** December 19, 2023

**First decision:** January 11, 2024

**Article in press:**

**Specialty type:** Psychiatry

**Country/Territory of origin:** Brazil

**Peer-review report's scientific quality classification**

Grade A (Excellent): 0

Grade B (Very good): 0

Grade C (Good): C, C

Grade D (Fair): D

Grade E (Poor): 0

**P-Reviewer:** Ng HY, China; Seeman MV, Canada; Zhang M, China **S-Editor:** Gong ZM

**L-Editor:** P-Editor:

6%

SIMILARITY INDEX

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	<a href="#">annfammed.org</a> Internet	28 words — 1%
2	<a href="#">systematicreviewsjournal.biomedcentral.com</a> Internet	26 words — 1%
3	<a href="#">journals.plos.org</a> Internet	23 words — 1%
4	<a href="#">oxfordjournals.org</a> Internet	22 words — 1%
5	Nicholas Barnes, Patrick Hattan, David S. Black, Zev Schuman-Olivier. "An Examination of Mindfulness-Based Programs in US Medical Schools", Mindfulness, 2016 Crossref	11 words — < 1%
6	<a href="#">f6publishing.blob.core.windows.net</a> Internet	11 words — < 1%
7	<a href="#">www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov</a> Internet	11 words — < 1%



