BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

CHECKLIST OF RESPONSIBILITIES FOR SCIENTIFIC EDITORS OF THE BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP JOURNALS

The primary responsibilities of our scientific editors include carefully checking the entire manuscript and all accompanying materials for: (1) errors in spelling, grammar, punctuation and wording; (2) suitability of tables, figures, figure data and legends; (3) accurate and appropriate presentation of symbols (*e.g.* +, -, ×, ÷, %, *) in tables and figures; and (4) complete and comprehensive revision of the manuscript according to the reviewers' comments.

The information for your currently assigned manuscript and the checklist are below:

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
Manuscript NO.: 16334
Column: Meta-Analysis
Title: Outcomes of robotic vs laparoscopic hepatectomy: A systematic review and meta-analysis
Authors: Roberto Montalti, Giammauro Berardi, Alberto Patriti, Marco Vivarelli, Roberto Ivan Troisi
Reviewer code: 02471365, 02992811,02468118
First decision: March 10, 2015
Scientific Editor: Qi Yuan
Date of signature: April 16, 2015

Item no.	Specific items for verification	Comments
1	The fixed headings are copied.	[Y]
2	The title concisely summarizes the main topic of the study and is not too long (no more than 12 words). Words such as 'exploration', 'research', 'analysis', 'observation', and 'investigation' are avoided. The title does not start with 'The' and does not include any Arabic numbers or uncommon abbreviations.	[Y]
3	A short running title is provided (no more than 6 words).	[Y]
4	The authors' full family (sur)names and full/abbreviated first names are listed on the title page and are consistent with those listed in the signed BPG Copyright Assignment form.	[Y]
5	The entire manuscript has been investigated for suspected or proven academic/publication misconduct before the manuscript is sent to the Editor-in-Chief.	[Y]
6	The authors' affiliations are listed on the title page and are consistent with those in the signed BPG Copyright Assignment form.	[Y]
7	The 'Supported by' statement describes the source(s) of financial support and includes the corresponding identification number(s) and program ID(s) if available, and contains no spelling errors.	[N]
8	The ethics-related statements are provided in accordance with the manuscript type.	[Y]

9	The 'Author contributions' passage describes the specific contribution(s) made by each author. The author's names are listed in the following format: full family (sur)name followed by abbreviated first and middles names. *e.g.*, "Wang CL and Liang L contributed equally to this work; Wang CL, Liang L, Fu JF, Zou CC, Hong F and Wu XM designed the research study; Wang CL, Zou CC, Hong F and Wu XM performed the research; Xue JZ and Lu JR contributed new reagents and analytic tools; Wang CL, Liang L and Fu JF analyzed the data; and Wang CL, Liang L and Fu JF wrote the manuscript. All authors have read and approve the final manuscript."	[Y]
10	The 'Correspondence to' passage provides the corresponding author's full first and family (sur)names, abbreviated title (*e.g.*, MD, PhD), affiliated institute's name and complete postal address (including zip code) and e-mail (written in all lowercase), and contains no spelling errors.	[Y]
11	The 'Telephone' and 'Fax' numbers are given for the corresponding author, and contain no spelling, punctuation or numerical errors. The telephone and fax numbers are composed of the plus symbol (+, which is the international exit code), the country code, the area or city code, and the local phone number (*e.g.*, +86-10-85381892).	[Y]
12	The Manuscript Tracking information (*i.e.*, Received, Peer review started, First decision, Revised, Accepted, Article in press, and Published online) are provided along with the corresponding editor and date for each item, and contain no spelling errors.	[Y]
13	The Abstract section is formatted according to the article-specific style (structured *vs* unstructured) and word count thresholds, as follows: Commentary, Frontier, Diagnostic Advances, Medical Ethics, Minireview, Review, Therapeutics Advances, and Topic Highlight: Non-structured abstract that is no less than 200 words. Field of Vision, Case Report and Letter to the Editor: Non-structured abstract that is no less than 150 words. Original Articles (Basic Study, Case Control Study, Clinical Trials Study, Observational Study, Prospective Study, Randomized Clinical Trial, Randomized Controlled Trial, Retrospective Cohort Study, and Retrospective Study): Structured abstract with subsections for AIM (no more than 20 words), METHODS (no less than 140 words), RESULTS (no less than 150 words), and CONCLUSION (no more than 26 words). Evidence-Based Medicine, Meta-Analysis, Scientometrics and Systematic Reviews: Structured abstract with subsections for AIM (no more than 20 words), METHODS (no less than 80 words), RESULTS (no less than 120 words), and CONCLUSION (no more than 26 words).	[Y]
14	The 'Key words' list provides 5-10 keywords that reflect the main content of the study. The first letter of each keyword is capitalized, and each keyword is separated by a semicolon.	[Y]
15	The 'Core tip' provides a summary (less than 100 words) of the study that outlines the most innovative and important arguments and core contents of the paper and will serve to effectively attract readers.	[Y]
16	The authors' full family (sur)names followed by abbreviated first/middle names provided in the bibliography information are consistent with those provided on both the title page and the signed BPG Copyright Assignment form.	[Y]
17	The 'INTRODUCTION' section clearly describes the relevant background information for the study. Only the most relevant and current (within the past 5 years) literature is cited, with the exception of rare instances of seminal literature citations. All technical terms and/or abbreviations are explained and/or defined, with the full name of abbreviations given upon first appearance in the text and the abbreviation presented in parentheses (*i.e.*, "…computed tomography (CT)"). First-person pronouns (*e.g.*, 'I', 'we') are used appropriately to clearly indicate the work performed by the author(s). When weaknesses of previous studies are described in	[Y]

	the text to highlight the innovations related to the current study, the information is presented carefully.	
18	The 'MATERIALS AND METHODS' section clearly and accurately describes all materials and methods used to obtain the data presented in the article and is adequate for a reader to repeat the study.	[Y]
19	The 'RESULTS' section concisely describes the observational and experimental results. Representative data and data that have scientific significance are emphasized. Data is presented in either the text, a table or figure (*i.e.*, chart, diagram, graph or image), but is not repeated among each. Information presented in the tables and figures clearly describes the trends, meaning, and inferences. Results described in textual form are accurate, concise and clear.	[Y]
20	The order and numerical labeling of tables and figures is consistent with their appearance and presentation in the text. Symbols in tables (*e.g.*, +, -, ×, ÷, ∗) correctly correspond to the definitions in the footnotes. Only one legend is provided for each multi-panel figure consisting of color graphs, black and white graphs, or line graphs that depicts data of the same theme. For example: **Figure 1** Pathological changes in atrophic gastritis tissue before and after treatment. A: …; B: …; C: …; D: …; E: …; F: ….	[Y]
21	Split pictures include flow charts, line graphs, histograms, and graphs including text. Unsplit pictures include meta-analysis diagrams, PCR amplification curves, and survival curves.	[Y]
22	Statistical symbols are accurate. Statistical significance is expressed as $^{a}P<0.05$, $^{b}P<0.01$ ($P>0.05$ usually does not need to be denoted). If there are other series of P values, $^{c}P<0.05$ and $^{d}P<0.01$ are used, and a third series of P values is expressed as $^{e}P<0.05$ and $^{f}P<0.01$. Statistical data is expressed as mean ± SD or mean ± SE.	[Y]
23	The 'DISCUSSION' section (1) describes the main purpose and hypothesis of the study, (2) summarizes the most important results, (3) illustrates and explains the results (but does not simply repeat the data) and draws conclusions or inferences based on the results, (4) points out the limitations of the study and their impact on the results, as well as proposes further advice on future research topic(s) or direction(s), and (5) describes the theoretical significance and practical value of the findings.	[Y]
24	The 'ACKNOWLEDGMENTS' section expresses gratitude to any individuals or organizations for technical support (*i.e.*, providing instrumentation, equipment or experimental materials, and/or assistance in experimental work), non-technical services (*i.e.*, useful inspiration, suggestions, guidance, or review), and/or any other auxiliary work.	[N]
25	The 'COMMENTS' section provides comments for original articles in accordance with the specified format.	[Y]
26	The 'REFERENCES' section lists the references in the Vancouver style. This style uses Arabic numeral in-text citations based on the order of the first appearance of a source in the text. For citations where the author's name is indicated in the text, a superscript number should be placed following the name (*i.e.*., "Pang et al"). For citations where no author is indicated, a superscript number should be placed at the end of the sentence. Respective examples are: "Ma [1] reported .....", "Pan et al [2-5] indicated ....."; "PCR has a high sensitivity [6,9]." No superscript numbers are used when the reference number is described in the text; for example, "The experimental method used has been described in reference [8]." The style of reference citations in tables is the same as that in the text (*e.g.*, Pan *et al* [2-5], please see reference [8]).	[Y]
27	Journal references have been verified to ensure that there are no duplicate references and that the PMID numbers are correct. For references not yet included in PubMed: the name of Chinese journals is spelled out using Chinese Pinyin, with the first letter of each word capitalized (*e.g.*, *Shijie Huaren Xiaohua Zazhi*); the name of journals in	[Y]

	other languages are listed according to indexing information retrieved from Google. Book references are presented with all the information relevant to the electronic version.	
28	The names of the peer reviewers and the scientific editor are present at the end of the paper (*e.g.*, P-Reviewer: Hugot D S-Editor: Wang JL).	[Y]
29	The number of cited references is appropriate for the article type, as follows: Commentary: no less than 50 Review: no less than 100 Article: no less than 30/26 Case Report and Letter to the Editor: no less than 1	[Y]
30	The language certificate is provided by authors who are non-native speakers of English (file name: ESPS Manuscript No.-Language certificate; *e.g.*, 870-Language certificate). The response letter is provided (file name: ESPS Manuscript No.-Answering reviewers; *e.g.*, 870-Answering reviewers). The revised manuscript is provided (file name: ESPS Manuscript No.-Review; *e.g.*, 870- Review). The letter of peer-reviewers' comments is provided (file name: ESPS Manuscript No.-Peer-review(s); *e.g.*, 870-Peer-review(s)). The Copyright Assignment form is provided (file name: ESPS Manuscript No.-Copyright assignment; *e.g.*, 870-Copyright assignment). The ethics-related statements are provided (*e.g.*, ESPS Manuscript No.-Institutional review board statement, ESPS Manuscript No.-Animal care and use statement, *etc.*). The agreement for use of personal photos is provided (file name: ESPS Manuscript No.-Agreement for use of personal photos; *e.g.*, 870-Agreement for use of personal photos).	[Y]
31	The author(s) highlighted the changes made to the manuscript according to the peer-reviewers' comments.	[Y]
32	The responses to the peer-reviewers' comments are consistent with the changes made to the manuscript.	[Y]
33	All authors signed the BPG Copyright Assignment form.	[Y]
34	The language certificate provided by authors who are non-native speakers of English meets the BPG requirements.	[Y]
35	The photos licensed in the Agreement for Use of Personal Photos are consistent with those in the paper.	[Y]
36	This document (Checklist of Responsibilities for Scientific Editors) has been saved under the file name: ESPS manuscript No.-Scientific editor work list (*e.g.*, 870-Scientific editor work list).	[Y]
37	A *CrossCheck* investigation (an effective tool for detecting unoriginal content, enabling our editors to preserve the journal's integrity and the authors' copyright) has been performed for the manuscript *via* the website: http://www.ithenticate.com/. The results document contains the following information for the manuscript: "Name of journal", "ESPS Manuscript No.", "Columns", "Title" and "Author list". The Figure of the *CrossCheck* results is saved in JPEG format (.jpg) at 1440 × 680 pixel resolution. Google searches have also been performed to further ensure publication of original content.	[Y]
38	The text of the manuscript is typed in Book Antiqua font, 10 pt, with 1.5 line spacing.	[Y]
	Publication process: Manuscript reception and registration→Initial review by scientific editor→Peer review→End of peer review→First round of meeting evaluation→To be accepted→Revision by the author(s)→Second round of meeting evaluation→To be accepted/revised/rejected→Final review by the Editor-in-Chief (final quality control for academic content and language quality)→Final acceptance and charging of publication fee→Language editing→Production→Proofreading by scientific editor→Proofreading by deputy editor→Final review by Editor-in-Chief→Release of online open-access papers in electronic	[Y]

	form on the BPG website→Release of online papers on PubMed Central→Delivery of high-quality PDF reprints to the author(s)→End of the publication process	

YES=[Y]; NO= [N].