

# CHECKLIST OF RESPONSIBILITIES FOR SCIENTIFIC EDITORS OF THE BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP (BPG) JOURNALS



**Manuscript No.:** 13101 **Scientific Editor:** Tian YL **Column:** Meta-Analysis **Date:** January 30, 2015

The primary responsibilities of scientific editors include carefully checking the entire manuscript and all accompanying materials for:

- errors in spelling, grammar, punctuation and wording
- suitability of tables, figures, figure data and legends
- accurate and appropriate presentation of symbols (e.g. +, -, ×, ÷, %, \*) in tables and figures
- complete and comprehensive revision of the manuscript according to the reviewers' comments

Item no.	Specific items for verification	Comments
1	Fixed headings are copied.	√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
2	The title concisely summarizes the main topic of the study and is not too long (no more than 12 words). The use of words such as 'exploration', 'research', 'analysis', 'observation', and 'investigation' is avoided. The title does not start with 'The' or Arabic numbers, and does not include uncommon abbreviations.	√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
3	A running title is provided (no more than 6 words).	√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
4	The authors' full family (sur)names and full/abbreviated first names listed on the title page are consistent with those in the signed BPG Copyright Assignment form. All authors have signed the BPG Copyright Assignment form. The entire manuscript has been investigated for suspected or proven academic/publication misconduct before the manuscript is sent to the Editor-in-Chief.	√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
5	The authors' affiliations listed on the title page are consistent with those in the signed BPG Copyright Assignment form.	√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
6	The 'Supported by' statement describes the source(s) of financial support, including identification number(s) and program ID(s) if available, and contains no spelling errors.	<input type="checkbox"/> YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
7	The 'Author contributions' passage describes the specific contributions made by each author, using the following format (full family (sur)name and abbreviated first and middles names): Wang CL and Liang L contributed equally to this work; Wang CL, Liang L, Fu JF, Zou CC, Hong F and Wu XM designed the research study; Wang CL, Zou CC, Hong F and Wu XM performed the research; Xue JZ and Lu JR contributed new reagents and analytic tools; Wang CL, Liang L and Fu JF analyzed the data; and Wang CL, Liang L and Fu JF wrote the manuscript.	√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
8	The 'Correspondence to' passage provides the full first and family (sur)names, abbreviated title (e.g. MD, PhD), affiliation's name and complete postal address (including zip code) and e-mail (written in all lowercase) of the corresponding author, and contains no spelling errors.	√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
9	The 'Telephone' and 'Fax' numbers are given for the corresponding author, and contain no spelling, punctuation or numerical errors. The telephone and fax numbers are composed of the plus symbol (+, which is the international exit code), the country code, the area or city code, and the local phone number (e.g. +86-10-85381892).	√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
10	The Manuscript Tracking information (i.e. Received, Peer review started, First decision, Revised, Accepted, Article in press, and Published online) provide the corresponding editor and date for each, and contain no spelling errors.	√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
11	The Abstract section is formatted according to the article-specific style (structure <i>vs</i> unstructured) and word count thresholds, as follows: <u>Commentary, Frontier, Diagnostic Advances, Medical Ethics, Minireview, Review, Therapeutics Advances and Topic Highlight</u> : Non-structured abstract that is no less than 200 words. <u>Field of Vision, Case Report and Letter to the Editor</u> : Non-structured abstract that is no less than 150 words. <u>Original Articles (Basic Study, Case Control Study, Clinical Trials Study, Observational Study, Prospective Study, Randomized Clinical Trial, Randomized Controlled Trial, Retrospective Cohort Study, and Retrospective Study)</u> : Structured abstract with subsections for AIM (no more than 20 words), METHODS (no less than 140 words), RESULTS (no less than 150 words), and CONCLUSION (no more than 26 words). <u>Evidence-Based Medicine, Meta-Analysis, Scientometrics and Systematic Reviews</u> :	√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO

	Structured abstract with subsections for AIM (no more than 20 words), METHODS (no less than 80 words), RESULTS (no less than 120 words), and CONCLUSION (no more than 26 words).	
12	The 'Keywords' list 5-10 keywords that reflect the main content of the study. The first letter of each keyword is capitalized, and each keyword is separated by a semicolon.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
13	The authors' full family (sur)names followed by abbreviated first/middle names in the bibliography information are consistent with those provided on both the title page and the signed BPG Copyright Assignment form.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
14	The 'INTRODUCTION' section clearly describes the relevant background information for the study. Only the most relevant and current (within the past 5 years) literature is cited, with the exception of rare instances of seminal literature citations. All technical terms and/or abbreviations are explained and/or defined, with the full name of abbreviations given upon first appearance in the text and the abbreviation presented in parentheses (i.e. "...computed tomography (CT)"). First-person pronouns (e.g. 'I', 'we') are used appropriately to clearly indicate the work performed by the author(s). When weaknesses of previous studies are described in the text to highlight the innovations related to the current study, the information is presented carefully.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
15	The 'MATERIALS AND METHODS' section clearly and accurately describes all materials and methods used to obtain the data presented in the article and is adequate for a reader to repeat the study.	<input type="checkbox"/> YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
16	The 'RESULTS' section concisely describes the observatory and experimental results. Representative data and data that have scientific significance are emphasized. Data is presented in either the text, a table or figure (i.e. chart, diagram, graph or image), but is not repeated among each. The information in tables and figures clearly describes the trends, meaning, and inferences. Results described in textual form are accurate, concise and clear.	<input type="checkbox"/> YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
17	The order and numerical labeling of tables and figures is consistent with their appearance and presentation in the text. Symbols in tables (e.g., +, -, ×, ÷, *) correctly correspond to the definitions in the footnotes. Only one legend is provided for each multi-panel figure consisting of color graphs, black and white graphs, or line graphs that depicts data of the same theme. For example: <b>Figure 1</b> Pathological changes in atrophic gastritis tissue before and after treatment. A: ...; B: ...; C: ...; D: ...; E: ...; F: ....	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
18	Split pictures include flow charts, line graphs, histograms, and graphs including text. Unsplit pictures include meta-analysis diagrams, PCR amplification curves, and survival curves.	<input type="checkbox"/> YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
19	Statistical symbols are accurate. Statistical significance is expressed as <sup>a</sup> $P < 0.05$ , <sup>b</sup> $P < 0.01$ ( $P > 0.05$ usually does not need to be denoted). If there are other series of $P$ values, <sup>c</sup> $P < 0.05$ and <sup>d</sup> $P < 0.01$ are used, and a third series of $P$ values is expressed as <sup>e</sup> $P < 0.05$ and <sup>f</sup> $P < 0.01$ . Statistical data is expressed as mean $\pm$ SD or mean $\pm$ SE.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
20	The 'DISCUSSION' section (1) describes the main purpose and hypothesis of the study, (2) summarizes the most important results, (3) illustrates and explains the results (but does not simply repeat the data) and draws conclusions or inferences based on the results, (4) points out the limitations of the study and their impact on the results, as well as proposes further advice on future research topic(s) or direction(s), and (5) describes the theoretical significance and practical value of the findings.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
21	The 'ACKNOWLEDGMENTS' section expresses gratitude to any individuals or organizations for technical support (i.e. providing instrumentation, equipment or experimental materials, and/or assistance in experimental work), non-technical services (i.e. useful inspiration, suggestions, guidance, or review), and/or any other auxiliary work.	<input type="checkbox"/> YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
22	The 'COMMENTS' section provides comments for original articles and brief articles in accordance with the specified format. 'Science News' is written for original articles in accordance with the specified format.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
23	The 'REFERENCES' section lists the references in the Vancouver style. This style uses Arabic numeric in-text citations based on the order of the first appearance of a source in the text. For citations where the author's name is indicated in the text, a superscript number should be placed following "Pang et al". For citations where no author is indicated, a superscript number should be placed at the end of the sentence. For example, Ma <sup>[1]</sup> reported ....., Pan et al <sup>[2-5]</sup> believed .....; PCR has a high sensitivity <sup>[6,9]</sup> . No superscript numbers are used when the reference number is described in the text (e.g. The experimental method used has been described in reference [8]). The style of reference citations in tables is the same as that in the text (e.g., Pan et al <sup>[2-5]</sup> , please see reference [8]).	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
24	Journal references have been verified to ensure that there are no duplicate references and that the PMID numbers are correct. For references not yet included in PubMed, the name of Chinese journals is spelled out using Chinese Pinyin, with the first letter of each word capitalized (e.g. Shijie Huaren Xiaohua Zazhi), and journals in other languages are listed according to indexing information retrieved from Google. Book references are presented with all the information relevant to the electronic version.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO

25	The names of the peer reviewers and the scientific editor are present at the end of the paper (e.g., P-Reviewer: Hugot D S-Editor: Wang JL).		√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
26	The number of cited references is appropriate for the article type: <u>Commentary</u> : no less than 50 <u>Review</u> : no less than 100 <u>Article</u> : no less than 30/26 Case Reports and Letter to the Editor: no less than 1		√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
27	The language certificate is provided by non-native speakers of English (file name: ESPS Manuscript No.-Language certificate; e.g. 870-Language certificate). The response letter is provided (file name: ESPS Manuscript No.-Answering reviewers; e.g. 870-Answering reviewers). The revised manuscript is provided (file name: ESPS Manuscript No.-Review; e.g. 870-Review). The letter of peer-reviewers' comments is provided (file name: ESPS Manuscript No.-Peer review(s); e.g. 870-Peer review(s)). The Copyright Assignment form is provided (file name: ESPS Manuscript No.-Copyright assignment; e.g., 870-Copyright assignment). The Agreement for Use of Personal Photos is provided (file name: ESPS Manuscript No.-Agreement for use of personal photos; e.g., 870-Agreement for use of personal photos).		√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
28	The author(s) highlighted the changes made to the manuscript according to the peer-reviewers' comments.		√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
29	The responses to the peer-reviewers' comments are consistent with the changes made to the manuscript.		√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
30	All authors signed the BPG Copyright Assignment form.		√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
31	The language certificate provided by non-native speakers of English meets the BPG requirements.		<input type="checkbox"/> YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
32	The photos licensed in the Agreement for Use of Personal Photos are consistent with those in the paper.		<input type="checkbox"/> YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
38	This document (Checklist of Responsibilities for Scientific Editors) has been saved under the file name: ESPS manuscript No.-Scientific editor work list (e.g. 870-Scientific editor work list).		√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
39	<i>CrossCheck</i> is an effective tool for detecting unoriginal content, enabling our editors to preserve the journal's integrity and the authors' copyright. For accepted manuscripts, a <i>CrossCheck</i> investigation has been performed via the website: <a href="http://www.ithenticate.com/">http://www.ithenticate.com/</a> . The results document contains "Name of journal", "ESPS Manuscript No.", "Columns", "Title" and "Author list" of the manuscript. The Figure of the <i>CrossCheck</i> results is saved in JPEG format (.jpg) and 1440 × 680 pixel resolution.		√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
40	The text of the manuscript is typed in Book Antiqua font, 10 pt, with 1.5 line spacing.		√YES <input type="checkbox"/> NO
	Publication process	Manuscript reception and registration→Initial review by scientific editor→Peer review→End of peer review→First round of meeting evaluation→To be accepted→Revision by the author(s)→Second round of meeting evaluation→To be accepted/revised/rejected→Final review by the Editor-in-Chief (final quality control for academic content and language quality)→Final acceptance and charging of publication fee→Language editing→Production→Proofreading by scientific editor→Proofreading by deputy editor→Final review by Editor-in-Chief→Release of online open-access papers in electronic form on the BPG website→Release of online papers on PubMed Central→Delivery of high-quality PDF reprints to the author(s)→End of the publication process	63.75 RMB/article