



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

Manuscript NO: 82824

Title: Clinical management of dural defects: a review

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03072151

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, MSc

Professional title: Academic Editor, Associate Professor, Attending Doctor, Neurosurgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Taiwan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2022-12-28

Reviewer chosen by: Yu-Lu Chen

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-01-05 14:50

Reviewer performed review: 2023-01-15 14:40

Review time: 9 Days and 23 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear editor and authors, Dong et al. performed a narrative review on the pearls and pitfalls of durotomies and dural defects. The text accurately reflects the present advancements and knowledge. This is generally a well written and interesting review and should be accepted with revisions. Quality of English is generally good although some minor grammatical mistakes are noted. The tables are very nice and complete. This covers a breadth of techniques that is accessible to a wide audience, in a subject area that surgeons are facing in a daily manner. In perspective, the information provides good detail and might considerably help to shape the patient's personalized assessment of therapeutic responses. All relevant previous work was captured and cited appropriately. It indeed gives a truly balanced view of the field. It is somewhat limited by an unfocused content that does not make it clear exactly why many of these techniques would be desirable in the clinical management of dural defects and in what conditions would the exact procedure be chosen.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

Manuscript NO: 82824

Title: Clinical management of dural defects: a review

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03999836

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Czech Republic

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2022-12-28

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-02-18 14:51

Reviewer performed review: 2023-02-18 20:07

Review time: 5 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The topic of the paper – the management of dural defects – is of utmost importance since the beginnings of neurosurgery. Therefore I highly appreciate the paper dealing with this problem. However – the first sentence of the Abstract is definitively incorrect - Dural defects are common in spinal and neurosurgery – should be e.g. Dural defects are common in spinal and cranial neurosurgery. Anyway the authors have provided the results of the latest research progress on dural repair methods and materials together with the characteristics and efficacy of these dural substitutes. The Introduction is well written and provides some interesting facts about the anatomy of brain envelopes. However the sentence In a meta-analysis of 23 studies, the incidence of dural injury was 5.8%[1]. In my opinion requires specification that the incidence is related to spinal surgery. Also the term dura mater encephalin is to the best knowledge of the reviewer absolutely unusual (better cranial dura mater). In the text there are some more sentences, verbal connections or words that require at least reconsideration. However the structure of the paper is adequate. The key subchapters describes adequately the principal techniques for dural repair – suture, biomaterials – grafts, protein based adhesives and

bacterial cellulose membrane, non biological materials, composite materials and other repair methods. These subchapters are followed by the concluding subchapter Systematic evaluation of dural repair technology and Conclusions. The extent of References is outstanding (96) and confirms the amount of meticulous work the authors have devoted to this paper of excellent educational value not only for neurosurgical residents. Finally I can gladly recommend the paper for publication after solving the problems of some unusual verbal connections and sentencies.