

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

Manuscript NO: 83925

Title: Anti-PD-1 antibody zimberelimab combined with chemotherapy as the first-line treatment of advanced malignant peritoneal mesothelioma: A case report

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03252941

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor, Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-03-01

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-03-03 23:56

Reviewer performed review: 2023-03-05 14:05

Review time: 1 Day and 14 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This case report presented a case of malignant peritoneal mesothelioma, which was successfully treated with anti-PD-1 combined with chemotherapy as a first-line treatment. This paper provides readers with valuable experience of treating a rare peritoneal mesothelioma with PD-1 inhibitor. I have some comments to improve the manuscript. 1. In Abstract, "A significant reduction in the patient's peritoneal tumors was accompanied by remarkable improvement in the patient's symptoms. Partial remission was achieved with a progression-free-survival period of 7 months. In addition, no immune-related adverse events occurred" should be placed in CASE SUMMARY. These sentences are not CONCLUSION. 2. In FIGURE1, the tumor should be pointed out by arrows. 3. In Outcome and follow-up, it is described that a new irregularly shaped solid mass in the pelvic vesicorectal fossa region was also observed (Figure 1C). This new lesion as well as the primary lesion should be specified by arrows in Figure 1. In addition, the authors say that that the tumor enlarged from 4.1 x 4.0 cm to 4.4 x 4.0 cm, which was evaluated as PD in the caption of Figure 1C. However, it must be stable disease by the RECIST guideline. 4. In CASE PRESENTATION, procedure of

pathological diagnosis, such as needle biopsy or incisional biopsy, should be presented. Next, microscopic findings of the tumor by hematoxylin and eosin staining should be presented. Immunohistochemistry of at least calretin should be presented to show the origin of mesothelium. Furthermore, presentation of PD-L1 is strongly desirable to increase the value of this case report. I recommend the authors get unstained sections from the pathological department and perform PD-L1 staining.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

Manuscript NO: 83925

Title: Anti-PD-1 antibody zimberelimab combined with chemotherapy as the first-line treatment of advanced malignant peritoneal mesothelioma: A case report

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05347388

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Attending Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United States

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-03-01

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-05-09 11:34

Reviewer performed review: 2023-05-22 00:29

Review time: 12 Days and 12 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Rare case report of malignant peritoneal mesothelioma treated with combination of chemotherapy and immunotherapy. 2. It was mentioned that he was treated with zimberelimab as it achieved achieved a higher ORR in relapsed/refractory classical Hodgkin lymphoma, any data for this drug in mesothelioma? 3. In the discussion - there was not even phase 1 or phase 2 trial discussion of combination of chemotherapy and immunotherapy in mesothelioma - so what was rationale for using the combination apart from he was young. Is there any data to back it up or was it used as a part of clinical trial. 4. Also there was no discussion about CheckMate 743 -phase 3 clinical trial first-line nivolumab plus ipilimumab significantly improved overall survival (OS) versus chemotherapy in patients with unresectable malignant pleural mesothelioma (MPM). were randomized 1 : 1 to nivolumab (3 mg/kg every 2 weeks) plus ipilimumab (1 mg/kg every 6 weeks) for up to 2 years, or six cycles of platinum plus pemetrexed chemotherapy. Median OS was 18.1 versus 14.1 months [hazard ratio (95% confidence interval), 0.73 (0.61–0.87)], and 3-year OS rates were 23% versus 15%, respectively supporting the combination of immunotherapy. Although the benefit appeared to be

greater in the non-epithelioid histology subgroup, median OS was similar with nivolumab plus ipilimumab in the epithelioid [18.2 months (95% CI, 16.9-21.9 months)] and non-epithelioid [18.1 months (95% CI, 12.2-22.8 months)] histology subgroups; 3-year OS rates were 24% and 22%, respectively. In contrast, median (95% CI) OS and 3-year OS rates differed with chemotherapy across histology subgroups; these were 16.7 months (14.9-20.3 months) and 19% in the epithelioid histology subgroup, and 8.8 months (7.4-10.2 months) and 4% in the non-epithelioid histology subgroup.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

Manuscript NO: 83925

Title: Anti-PD-1 antibody zimberelimab combined with chemotherapy as the first-line treatment of advanced malignant peritoneal mesothelioma: A case report

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03397272

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Slovenia

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-03-01

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-03-20 08:23

Reviewer performed review: 2023-05-25 04:35

Review time: 65 Days and 20 Hours

Scientific quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] Anonymous [<input type="checkbox"/>] Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="checkbox"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Well written, no specific changes needed.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

Manuscript NO: 83925

Title: Anti-PD-1 antibody zimberelimab combined with chemotherapy as the first-line treatment of advanced malignant peritoneal mesothelioma: A case report

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03252941

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor, Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-03-01

Reviewer chosen by: Yuan-Yuan Fu (Quit 2023)

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-06-25 23:47

Reviewer performed review: 2023-06-26 00:06

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors made satisfactory responses to my comments. I have no more comments.