

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 86076

Title: Clinical study of extrahepatic biliary adenoma

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03477763

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Turkey

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-05-30

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-06-20 11:09

Reviewer performed review: 2023-06-22 19:27

Review time: 2 Days and 8 Hours

	[] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Very good [] Grade C:
Scientific quality	Good
	[] Grade D: Fair [] Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	[] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Good [] Grade C: Fair [] Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of	[] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Good [] Grade C: Fair
this manuscript	[] Grade D: No creativity or innovation



Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	 [] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Good [] Grade C: Fair [] Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing [] Grade B: Minor language polishing [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	 [] Accept (High priority) [Y] Accept (General priority) [] Minor revision [] Major revision [] Rejection
Re-review	[]Yes [Y]No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Ι congratulate authors the for Extrahepatic biliary adenoma is a rare and easily misdiagnosed benign biliary lesion name's article. Best regards.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 86076

Title: Clinical study of extrahepatic biliary adenoma

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 01438831

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Chief Doctor, Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-05-30

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-06-27 07:43

Reviewer performed review: 2023-06-27 12:29

Review time: 4 Hours

	[] Grade A: Excellent [] Grade B: Very good [Y] Grade C:
Scientific quality	Good
	[] Grade D: Fair [] Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	[] Grade A: Excellent [] Grade B: Good [Y] Grade C: Fair [] Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	 [] Grade A: Excellent [] Grade B: Good [Y] Grade C: Fair [] Grade D: No creativity or innovation



Baishideng

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA Telephone: +1-925-399-1568 **E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com https://www.wjgnet.com

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	[] Grade A: Excellent [] Grade B: Good [Y] Grade C: Fair [] Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	[] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	 [] Accept (High priority) [] Accept (General priority) [Y] Minor revision [] Major revision [] Rejection
Re-review	[]Yes [Y]No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a paper on extrahepatic biliary adenoma. Extrahepatic biliary adenoma is a very rare condition and this paper includes 9 cases. This paper seems worth publishing, but some points must be precise. In Patients and Methods, `in the past 6 years` should be concretely described such as from ... to ... Table 1 should preferably include the size and number of tumors. Please add the cause of obstruction of Case 3. Other modalities such as EUS or PET-CT seem very useful, so please add the findings if there are some cases. There is no explanation of Figure 5 in the manuscript.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 86076

Title: Clinical study of extrahepatic biliary adenoma

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 01558248

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: FACS, MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor, Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Taiwan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-05-30

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-06-27 07:34

Reviewer performed review: 2023-06-29 07:42

Review time: 2 Days

	[] Grade A: Excellent [] Grade B: Very good [] Grade C:
Scientific quality	Good
	[Y] Grade D: Fair [] Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	[] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Good [] Grade C: Fair [] Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of	[] Grade A: Excellent [] Grade B: Good [Y] Grade C: Fair
this manuscript	[] Grade D: No creativity or innovation



Baishideng

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA Telephone: +1-925-399-1568 **E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com https://www.wjgnet.com

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	[] Grade A: Excellent [] Grade B: Good [Y] Grade C: Fair [] Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	[] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	 [] Accept (High priority) [] Accept (General priority) [] Minor revision [Y] Major revision [] Rejection
Re-review	[]Yes [Y]No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [] Anonymous [Y] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Title with "A case report", actually there are nine cases. 2. The title name " Extrahepatic biliary adenoma...easily misdiagnosed benign biliary lesion – A case report". Extrahepatic biliary adenoma is belonging to one of the benign biliary lesion and not a misdiagnosis. How about to change the title into" Clinical study of extrahepatic biliary adenoma" or others 3. Was there biliary adenoma combined with ductal stone in your series? Authors need to give the data. 4. In the section of "Therapy and pathological characteristics" The location of adenomas was in the common bile duct (6/9, 66.7%) and common hepatic duct (3/9, 33.3%). One (11.1 %) case involved multiple ducts in continuity. The calculation was wrong. Because the double lesions was existed for example the Figure 3. 5. Please add arrow signs for demonstrating the tumor lesion in the figure 1, 2. And 3. 6. Please described more about size of tumor mass and an arrow sign to show where the mass is? 7. Choice one figure was enough among the 6 figures in the Figure 5 8. The demonstration of cases series in the Table 1, please change X-axis and Y-axis in order to let the reader to read and edition easily.