

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 86133

Title: A Case Report of Malignant Hidroacanthoma Simplex and literature review

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03976790 Position: Editor-in-Chief Academic degree: DSc, PhD

Professional title: Emeritus Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: France

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-06-01

**Reviewer chosen by:** Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-06-17 09:34

Reviewer performed review: 2023-06-25 08:22

**Review time:** 7 Days and 22 Hours

	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C:
Scientific quality	Good
	[ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ Y] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ Y] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair
this manuscript	[ ] Grade D: No creativity or innovation



Scientific significance of the	[Y] Grade A: Excellent [] Grade B: Good [] Grade C: Fair
conclusion in this manuscript	[ ] Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing [] Grade B: Minor language polishing [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	[ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority) [ Y] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection
Re-review	[ ]Yes [Y]No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous  Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments about the manuscript: "A Case Report of Malignant Hidroacanthoma Simplex and literature review" Malignant hidroacanthoma simplex (HAS) is a rare skin tumour. In this manuscript, the authors present the case of an 88-year-old woman with such a pathology whose diagnosis was co-confirmed by histological and immunohistological examinations. The authors also reviewed the literature on previous cases of malignant HAS. This article seems useful to me, especially since it is a case of a rare condition. The addition of bibliographic data relating to other similar cases is also very useful. This article deserves to be published after, however, some improvements to the manuscript. Here are some remarks. Page 2, INTRODUCTION. "Hidroacanthoma simplex (HAS), a rare tumor (...) was initially characterized in 1956": It would be interesting to add a historical reference. Page 4, FURTHER DIAGNOSTIC WORK-UP. "Histopathological examination": Some explanations on the technique used would be useful: what fixative was used? Have the tissues been embedded in paraffin? what was the method of dehydration? It would be useful to specify the staining used (hemalun-eosin). Immunohistochemical staining": Some details on the



7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA **Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

https://www.wjgnet.com

immunohistochemical method would be useful: what is the origin (reference distributor) of the antibodies, what was the staining method used (use of a secondary antibody, use of peroxidases, nature of the chromogen (DAB, I suppose) How were the negative controls prepared? Page 6. CONCLUSIONS. "Precise diagnosis depends on histopathological examination, and immunohistochemical analysis": This sentence (which I am happy to read) is one more reason to elaborate on the histological and immunohistological methods used. Page 9, figure 1a, b, c: A scale bar would be useful (more than magnification which varies with the size of the printed image). Page 10, figure 2 a, b, c: Scale bars would be helpful (see previous note for Figure 1). It would help if each image were detailed using arrows to show the important points described in the text. Page 10, table 1. I appreciate this table summarizing 10 other cases with details. But I am afraid the table is not complete because it's too wide for the page.



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 86133

Title: A Case Report of Malignant Hidroacanthoma Simplex and literature review

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03252920 Position: Peer Reviewer Academic degree: PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Brazil

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-06-01

**Reviewer chosen by:** Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-07-10 12:24

Reviewer performed review: 2023-07-18 10:56

**Review time:** 7 Days and 22 Hours

	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [Y] Grade C:
Scientific quality	Good
	[ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ Y] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ Y] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No creativity or innovation



Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	[ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority) [ Y] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection
Re-review	[ ]Yes [Y]No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous  Conflicts-of-Interest: [Y] Yes [ ] No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I am not able to revise the manuscript. The matter is not within my area of expertise. I marked the acceptance by mistake and sent an email to the BPG help desk immediately afterwards, notifying about the error. Apologies for what happened.