BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases
ESPS manuscript NO: 10929
Title: Concomitant Achondroplasia and Chiari II malformation: a double-hit at the cervicomedullary junction.
Reviewer code: 00542914
Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen
Date sent for review: 2014-04-27 22:47
Date reviewed: 2014-06-10 21:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[Y] Grade B: Very good	[ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] Existing	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[ ] Existing	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The ms of Awad et al desribes a neonate case with concomitant achondroplasia and Chiari II malformation (CMII). According to a literature review performed by the authors this is the first case report of a patient with this combination. This is definitely an interesting case that is thoroughly documented. Even though I am not an expert in the interpretation of MRI images everything seems to be very well described. Apparently, the genetic cause for CMII has not yet been identified but animal models and candidate genes are nicely discussed. However, with regard to the potential link between the two conditions I would find it interesting to show or at least mention the result of the FGFR3 mutation analysis. I know that 99% of the achondroplasia cases are caused by the Gly380Arg substitution but a lot more very rare mutations were identified over the last years. Maybe the knowledge of the mutation could give some insight into the underlying pathomechanism especially as some of the very rare mutations in FGFR3 were also associated with cranial malformations, like e.g. Crouzon syndrome, Muenke syndrome and others.