

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5976

Title: Severe isolated sciatic neuropathy due to a modified lotus position.

Reviewer code: 01328502

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 14:56

Date reviewed: 2013-10-11 05:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors report an interesting clinical case with a novel clinical entity. Presentation is extremely clear.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5976

Title: Severe isolated sciatic neuropathy due to a modified lotus position.

Reviewer code: 00505420

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 14:56

Date reviewed: 2013-10-13 05:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Severe isolated sciatic neuropathy due to a modified lotus position. The authors present a case of a sciatic nerve palsy due to a persistent lotus position. Sciatic nerve palsy/injury due to positional issues is well known and has been described in literature several times. Thus I do not think that this case report is worth publishing as there is no new message nor does it add to our understanding of this disease.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS Manuscript NO: 5976

Title: Severe isolated sciatic neuropathy due to a modified lotus position.

Reviewer code: 02489549

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-09-30 14:56

Date reviewed: 2013-10-13 22:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have discussed a case of sciatic neuropathy, which they assume has been generated due to continuous sitting in modified lotus position. Although this might be a possible cause, there is no way to verify this hypothesis. Furthermore, the fact that the patient suffered from post-traumatic stress disorder and schizophrenia, should also be taken into account when discussing this case. Both of these medical conditions are associated with alterations in the release profile and action of neurotransmitters (mainly dopamine and serotonin), and, though not in general, but in some cases the patients suffering from PTSD develop different types of somatic complications, thus this might be considered as a side mechanism contributing to the observed neuropathy. In general, I think the manuscript could be considered for publication if the authors could provide more evidence supporting their hypothesis, perhaps by performing a more thorough review of the literature or suggesting more comprehensive pathophysiological mechanisms which could justify their claim.