

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS Manuscript NO: 11950

Title: Verrucous carcinoma of the esophagus: A case report and literature review

Reviewer code: 00044718

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-30 14:43

Date reviewed: 2013-11-24 20:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors described a rare tumor of verrucous carcinoma of the esophagus. Indeed this case are rare, however there are no impacts for readers form the viewpoints of clinical and histological aspects. Comments 1. In the literature, the authors should show the clinical outcome, especially in advanced cancer. 2. In the present case, how about the effect of chemoradiation therapy and clinical outcome? You should describe regimen schedule of chemoradiation. 3. The relationship between verrucous carcinoma of the esophagus and HPV infection should be described quoting literatures. 4. You should show the pictures of EUS and CT. 5. What is the pathogenesis of non radiating abdominal pain? Is this symptom associate with the esophageal tumor? 6. As the authors mentioned the tumor seems to be associated with the chronic inflammatory condition, why not examine expression of inflammatory cytokines of serum and tumor? 7. There are no descriptions of Figure 1 to 4 in the text.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: editorialoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS Manuscript NO: 11950

Title: Verrucous carcinoma of the esophagus: A case report and literature review

Reviewer code: 02445767

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-30 14:43

Date reviewed: 2013-12-09 09:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

None.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS Manuscript NO: 11950

Title: Verrucous carcinoma of the esophagus: A case report and literature review

Reviewer code: 02542352

Science editor: Cui, Xue-Mei

Date sent for review: 2013-10-30 14:43

Date reviewed: 2013-12-15 01:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for the opportunity to review this manuscript. The authors report a case of a verrucous esophageal cancer, a rare variant of the squamous esophageal cancer. Comments, 1) Case presentation: Please name the figures in the text in accordance with their appearance. 2) Case presentation: Please include units of hemoglobin and MCV. Please avoid contractions or write the first time the full word (MCV, USG, CT....) 3) Please include a picture of the EUS and remove one of the upper endoscopy 4) As the authors pointed out, histological diagnosis of this tumour is frequently difficult to achieve. In fact, as in this case occurred, several upper endoscopies are usually needed and leading to a delayed in the final diagnosis and treatment. Discussion: The authors should insist on the characteristic endoscopic features of this type of tumor in order to arise the clinical suspicion and make an early diagnosis. 5) Discussion: Several EUS patterns have been described about this tumor. Adrian de Ganzo et al (Eur J Gastroenterol 2013), recently described a linitis-like pattern characteristic of this tumor. This reference should be included as well as the decription of EUS patterns. 6) Discussion: There are not 25 cases described. For instance, the mentioned paper by Adrian de Ganzo, et al., was not included in the references. 7) Discussion: this is not a unique case. Adrian de Ganzo et al., decribed two cases without any documented risk factors. Remove this sentence from the discussion. 8) The conclusion should be shorter, summarizing not repeating the information given in the discussion.