

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS manuscript NO: 17089

Title: First description of cervical intradural thymoma metastasis

Reviewer's code: 00631883

Reviewer's country: Austria

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-02-12 16:34

Date reviewed: 2015-04-23 22:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript presents an interesting case report of an intradural metastasis from a metastatic B3 thymoma. Major comments: "He underwent resection of a thoracic metastasis after 1 year." >>> Please describe where the thoracic metastasis was. "He underwent resection of the lesion and C5-D1 stabilization" >>> Please describe resection margin? R0? Was the dura complete during the entire surgery? "...new lesion at C5-C7 level" One may have the strong impression that this local recurrence or residual tumor, rather than a new haematogenic metastasis. Please describe more clearly. Please include arrows or arrowheads within the MR figures to enlighten the details. Figure 1 looks like a MIP reconstruction from CT data.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS manuscript NO: 17089

Title: First description of cervical intradural thymoma metastasis

Reviewer's code: 00646543

Reviewer's country: Mexico

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-02-12 16:34

Date reviewed: 2015-05-13 01:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The report by Mancarella is interesting and intriguing, particularly because it would be the first documented case; I have some points: 1. Contrary to the statement "Description of the first case" this would be the first report, there is no way to know if it is indeed the "first case". 2. Hyperbolic statements in scientific literature look odd; "An extremely rare case" is only a rare case. The usual slogan "... Review of the literature" is obsolete in the era of the internet; besides, if it is the first case the literature would be rather scanty. I would suggest a concise title like "First description of Intradural Thyoma Metastasis" 3. Some lines must be corrected or clarified e.g. "without adjuvant therapy" (P3,p2,L1); "He performed a cervical spine MRI" (P3,p3,L2); "extremely adherent to the spinal cord" (P3,p3,L8); "the patient improved neurological symptoms" (P2,p2,L5). 4. The reference for Muller is lacking (P3,p4,L3), the same for the reference in Japan (P4,p2,L2). 5. What is the meaning of "and one because it did not report sufficient data to include it in our casistic" (sic), if they meant casuistic, a single case is not a casuistic. Similarly, the line "Only 1 case..." (P5,p1,L6) should be deleted. The first line of conclusions is contradictory.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS manuscript NO: 17089

Title: First description of cervical intradural thymoma metastasis

Reviewer's code: 00646452

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Yue-Li Tian

Date sent for review: 2015-02-12 16:34

Date reviewed: 2015-04-09 07:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The present case report is worth publishing, as it documents an extremely rare case of an intradural thymoma metastasis. However, English writing is poor and it is very difficult for this manuscript to be published in the original form. Also, this manuscript should be rearranged for the journal format. Major concern: 1) There are too many sentences to be grammatically corrected. Minor point: 1) C5-D1 should be C5-Th1.