

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS manuscript NO: 25152

Title: Idiopathic hypereosinophilic syndrome presenting with severe vasculitis successfully treated with imatinib

Reviewer's code: 02445130

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-02-26 10:32

Date reviewed: 2016-03-02 01:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present case report, Fraticelli et al. described the use of a low dose of Imatinib meslate in the treatment of Idiopathic hypereosinophilic syndrome. In general, the manuscript is well written, I have only a few suggestions for the authors to consider. Major recommendations: 1) In Figure 1 and 2, it will be better to describe the figures in much more details in the Figure legends. In the current form it is not acceptable. 2) In Figure 1, some indications (like arrows) will be useful to point out the granulated eosinophilic cells. Scale bars are also required to show in the figures. 3) There are several typos/ grammatical mistakes throughout the manuscript which need improvements.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS manuscript NO: 25152

Title: Idiopathic hypereosinophilic syndrome presenting with severe vasculitis successfully treated with imatinib

Reviewer's code: 00402729

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-02-26 10:32

Date reviewed: 2016-03-03 03:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A difficult case managed well. However not novel. Generalization of eosinophils were not clonal should be taken out since the absence of rearrangements do not include clonality. In fact this very test if the patient were a female could be done by g6pd analysis, would definitely improve the level of quality of this paper. Otherwise there needs to be a thesis that needs to be stated are authors saying that they recommend in no uncertain terms an imitative trial for primary progressive eosinophilia, then say it. Otherwise good effort but an anecdote. Great case though. Regarding language, interferon was not used because..., and not for...as the authors stated.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

ESPS manuscript NO: 25152

Title: Idiopathic hypereosinophilic syndrome presenting with severe vasculitis successfully treated with imatinib

Reviewer's code: 01554641

Reviewer's country: Croatia

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-02-26 10:32

Date reviewed: 2016-03-01 02:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript: "Idiopathic hypereosinophilic syndrome, presenting with life-threatening vasculitic manifestations. A case of successful use of Imatinib mesilate" is a report on a hypereosinophilic syndrome (HES) where in spite of molecular diagnosis where PDGFR rearrangement, BCR-ABL, PDGFRA, PDGFR β , WT1 or c-KIT resulted all negative the tyrosine-kinase inhibitor imatinib mesilate treatment led to a complete recovery. The paper is interesting, well prepared and is important to be published. Minor language polishing necessary.