



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 33105

Title: Recurrent aneurysmal bone cyst of talus resulted in tibiotalocalcaneal arthrodesis

Reviewer's code: 02880499

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-02-19

Date reviewed: 2017-02-19

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|--|--|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No | <input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E: Poor | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> [] The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> [] Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> [] Plagiarism | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> [Y] No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

An interesting case report: minor comments: please describe more about Aneurysmal Bone Cyst of Talus: does this a benign clinical condition, what the impact on health if not tx, and how about the risk and adverse of surgical tx.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 33105

Title: Recurrent aneurysmal bone cyst of talus resulted in tibiototalcaneal arthrodesis

Reviewer's code: 02728719

Reviewer's country: Austria

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-03-02

Date reviewed: 2017-03-05

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| | | BPG Search: | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In their manuscript the authors describe a case of a 25-years-old patient with an aneurysmal bone cyst of the talus. Following curettage and bone grafting the ABC recurred and was then treated with complete resection and tibiototalcaneal arthrodesis. The follow-up at 18 months postoperatively is presented. I have some comments: ? The English language needs revision, preferably done by a native speaker. ? The abstract should be a bit more detailed. The authors, for instance, do not state that the ABC was resected at the second procedure. ? Introduction: ABC lesion should be replaced by ABC only. ? Introduction: The statement "Recurrence of ABC lesion of the talus after curettage and bone grafting is extremely rare." Needs a reference. ? Case report: Was the patient initially treated in another hospital? Does that mean he had pain and swelling of the ankle for 18 months before he presented to your department? The history is a bit unclear. ? Was an MRI performed? ? The range of motion was limited. How much? ? Discussion: The authors state that the recurrence was seen 8 months following the first operation. How do the authors know that? Are there radiographs or is this just an



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

assumption due to the occurrence of pain? ? The discussion is a bit short and should discuss the patient and ABC more detailed.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 33105

Title: Recurrent aneurysmal bone cyst of talus resulted in tibiototalcaneal arthrodesis

Reviewer's code: 02689304

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2017-03-02

Date reviewed: 2017-03-06

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1.The whole concept is acceptable. 2.The description of manuscript is smooth but English grammar and typing errors still require re-checking. e.g. sometimes using talus and sometimes using the talus, 25 year-old-man (Abstract) vs. 25-year-old man (Case report), capital or lowercase --- etc. 3.Cyst is a common noun and should be singular or plural. The article should be added. e.g. a, an or the. 4.Too many keywords? 5.The tibiototalcaneus arthrodesis can also be finished by a retrograde locked intramedullary nail from the subtalar joint. Is it simpler as compared to your technique? Please comment in Discussion and add references. 6.Reference 9, something is lost? Incomplete description of pages.