

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3800

Title: Meta-Analysis of Anti-Ribosomal P Antibodies in Lupus Psychosis

Reviewer code: 02459161

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-05-24 15:16

Date reviewed: 2013-08-07 04:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Linz & Miller present an interesting manuscript regarding the potential relationship between anti-ribosomal P antibodies and psychotic symptoms in patients with lupus. A literature review was conducted and results of a meta-analysis indicate an increased risk of psychosis when arP antibodies are present in patients with lupus. The topic is up-to-date and the results are of high interest for other researchers. The manuscript is very well written and the authors are clearly knowledgeable in their field. However I think the manuscript could be improved regarding the following points:

- In the introduction the author refer to both "schizophrenia" and "psychosis". It would be important clearly introduce the terminology and to specify what do we mean, when we say "schizophrenia" and what we mean when we say "psychosis". In principle the paper refers to psychosis in patients with lupus and as such more emphasis should be put in the introduction on psychosis rather than on schizophrenia.
- In the introduction several studies are referenced that show an association between schizophrenia and immune system abnormalities. Are those findings specific for schizophrenia, for psychosis or are there similar results in patients with e.g. depression?
- "Psychosis is rare, but a very well-documented neuropsychiatric sequelae of SLE". Please add a reference. How rare (please quantify)? What are psychotic features present in SLE and are they similar/different to the psychotic features present in schizophrenia?
- "A number of previous studies have reported an association between arP antibodies and lupus psychosis". Please add references. Please add one sentence summarizing whether those findings differ or not.
- Is reference 12 really a meta-analysis as mentioned in the text?
- Why not add "schizophrenia" in the search term? What that indentify further studies?
- The authors exclude studies in which there were no cases of lupus psychosis (n=4). Why? That might have created a bias in the results. Please change or discuss

as a limitation. - What is a "significant overlap"? Please quantify. - Page 5: what are "ES estimates"? Effect size estimates? Please introduce abbreviation. - In the methods section the authors state that heterogeneity was considered significant when $p < 0.1$. In the results $p = 0.09$ is reported but the authors state that there was no significant heterogeneity. - Please add Egger's test to check for funnel plot asymmetry. - The moderating effect of covariates on effect size measures should be investigated. Is there an effect of year of publication, essay type, gender and age of patients. - In the discussion it is stated that the effect of covariates was not tested. Why? - The studies included in the meta-analysis should be specified in greater detail. What were the characteristics of the patient samples (age, gender, symptom scores, medication). What were the psychotic symptoms reported. What were the rheumatic symptoms they reported. In which stage of SLE were the patients. Did they receive immune-suppressive medication? - In the funnel plot and in the forrest plot only 15 studies are shown. It seems Caponi et al., 2002 is missing. Please add and update results. - Page 6 typo: "that more that..." - Page 7 typo: "as well at the PAR%...." - Are there other antibodies that could be investigated? - Is there any pathophysiological hypothesis how the aRP antibodies lead to psychosis?

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

ESPS Manuscript NO: 3800

Title: Meta-Analysis of Anti-Ribosomal P Antibodies in Lupus Psychosis

Reviewer code: 00143238

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-05-24 15:16

Date reviewed: 2013-08-08 03:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Systematic review of pertinent literature on positivity of anti-ribosomal P antibodies on patients with lupus psychosis. Data supports a potential role for anti-ribosomal P antibodies in lupus psychosis, in view of positivity for these antibodies in 51% of affected patients. Findings strengthened previous reports in the literature about this association.