

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4232

Title: Statin use and the risk of liver cancer: a meta-analysis of 7 studies involving more than 4.7 million patients

Reviewer code: 02439510

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-06-22 20:30

Date reviewed: 2013-07-09 08:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Zhang H, et al. reported that the association between statin use and the risk of liver cancer was determined by a meta-analysis. This analysis was involved in 7 studies, 4,725,593 people and 9,785 liver cancer cases from 2005 to 2013. The result showed a 36-39% reduction in liver cancer risk when used statin. This study is very interesting. However, authors may add a figure of the quality of reporting of meta- analyses statement to show how to select 7 studies. In addition, there have some information needed to check whether they are consistent. For example, in the abstract, authors stated that "A computerized literature search was conducted to identify those relevant studies between January 1966 and March 2013" and the result section "These studies involved 4,725,593 people and 9,785 liver cancer cases. They were published between the year of 2005 and 2013." Please check this information; in introduction section, it should be 4.9 per 100,000 people; give full name of "HCV", etc.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4232

Title: Statin use and the risk of liver cancer: a meta-analysis of 7 studies involving more than 4.7 million patients

Reviewer code: 00069394

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-06-22 20:30

Date reviewed: 2013-08-11 19:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors conducted the meta-analysis of 7 studies on statin use and its association with liver cancer risk in 4,725,593 people and 9,875 liver cancer cases. They showed that statin use was significantly associated with a 36-39% reduction of liver cancer risk. I have a few suggestions and comments; 1. The duration of literature search was not consistent. Please make the correction. 2. It must be better if the authors could provide the flow chart of the selection for inclusion in their meta-analysis. 3. Discussion section: "Our result from liver cancer was not supported by another meta-analysis which was performed to determine the association between statins use and the risk of colorectal cancer.[24] This study involved eighteen studies and more than 1.5 million participants. The authors found that there was no evidence of an association between statin use and risk of colorectal cancer either among RCTs (RR 0.95, 95%CI 0.80-1.13, n=6) or among cohort studies (RR 0.96, 95%CI 0.84-1.11, n=3), although statin use was associated with a modest reduction in the risk of colorectal cancer among case-control studies. It seems that more studies are required in more kinds of malignancies." should be deleted since it is irrelevant to liver cancer. 4. Similar to this study, there are two recent studies regarding statins and association with a reduced risk of liver cancer in which the authors should discuss their study in detail with those observations. Danitza P, et al. Statins and primary liver cancer: a meta-analysis of observational studies. Eur J Cancer Prev 2013; 22:229-34. Singh S, et al. Statins are associated with a reduced risk of hepatocellular cancer: A systemic review and meta-analysis. Gastroenterol 2013; 144:323-32.