

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

ESPS manuscript NO: 9651

Title: Pharmacological Treatment of Obesity: a Review of Currently Used Drugs

Reviewer code: 00506294

Science editor: Xiu-Xia Song

Date sent for review: 2014-02-22 20:40

Date reviewed: 2014-03-03 20:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review about: " Pharmacological Treatment of Obesity: a Review of Currently Used Drugs and New Compounds in Clinical Development" is a complete review about obesity as a chronic disease which requires treatment and pharmacotherapy could be an important adjunct to lifestyle measures to improve the induction and maintenance of weight loss and it is important to develop new safe compounds. The authors review the current medications approved by European Medicines Agency and USA Food and Drug Administration for the treatment of obesity, their benefits and risks, as well as the new drugs which are presently under clinical trials. They also list the antio-besity agents that have been withdrawn as consequence of their side effects. The revision is based on Pubmed studies published. Orlistat is currently the only long-term pharmacotherapy for obesity available in the European market. Lorcaserin, the association of phentermine and topiramate, were recently approved by Food and Drug Administration. Orlistat suppresses appetite inhibiting gastrointestinal lipase. Lorcaserin activates 5-HT_{2C} receptors, phentermine is a norepinephrine releasing drug, and topiramate is an anticonvulsant drug with weight loss properties. They also review all the trials about new drugs a possible the interest of different drugs to be useful in obesity treatment. They consider that the growth of biomedical science in the last years and also the knowledge of the energy metabolism, may provide new and better therapies for this condition.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

ESPS manuscript NO: 9651

Title: Pharmacological Treatment of Obesity: a Review of Currently Used Drugs

Reviewer code: 00506113

Science editor: Xiu-Xia Song

Date sent for review: 2014-02-22 20:40

Date reviewed: 2014-03-13 04:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting and well written review article about the Pharmacological Treatment of Obesity. Here are my comments: 1. Introduction should be shortened. I believe that the references about drugs that have been withdrawn from the market should be incorporated in a separate chapter. 2. The chapters for sibutramine and CB1 antagonists should be removed since these drugs have been withdrawn. Few information about their action, reverse events and cause of withdrawal could be included in the aforementioned separate chapter 3. Chapter 3.7 (Anorexigenic Gut Hormones) has also to be omitted since it confers information only about the physiologic action of the hormones. 4. "However, Contrave?, liraglutide and tesofensine have shown cardiovascular side effects in clinical trials, which led FDA not to approve them yet." Please provide a reference that liraglutide is not approved due to cardiovascular side effects. According to my knowledge GLP-1 antagonism has probably favourable actions to heart and vasculature. 5. "Figure 3 Proportion of participants who lost at least 5%, 10% and 15% of baseline weight at week 56." (which study ?) 6. Figures 4 and 5 are better to be omitted (for reasons I explained before) 7. Tables 1 and 2 could be merged (Drug/Placebo substracted mean weight loss/ Mechanism of action/Other positive Effects/ Adverse effects). Information about status can be added to Figure 6, since it has already some data about this I suggest the publication of this review article after a minor revision

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

ESPS manuscript NO: 9651

Title: Pharmacological Treatment of Obesity: a Review of Currently Used Drugs

Reviewer code: 00504962

Science editor: Xiu-Xia Song

Date sent for review: 2014-02-22 20:40

Date reviewed: 2014-03-20 09:59

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors described about pharmacological treatment of obesity. Overall, the review is well-written and the topic is very important in the field.