



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Meta-Analysis

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 14420

**Title:** The fate of meta-analyses: the case of Helicobacter pylori

**Reviewer code:** 02460731

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2014-10-06 18:43

**Date reviewed:** 2014-10-09 03:40

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper is not a meta-analytic approach to the problem. Is a simple description of literature en relation to Helicobacter Pylori. This papeer must be directer to other journal.



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Meta-Analysis

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 14420

**Title:** The fate of meta-analyses: the case of Helicobacter pylori

**Reviewer code:** 00183471

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2014-10-06 18:43

**Date reviewed:** 2014-10-07 16:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Language needs corrections at many places as in the heading of Historical background; line -7 "effect of typhoid fever inoculation in volunteers" not clear. 2. Inclusion of meta-analysis in consensus statements; line -6 the meaning of "identic" is not clear.



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Meta-Analysis

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 14420

**Title:** The fate of meta-analyses: the case of Helicobacter pylori

**Reviewer code:** 02455519

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2014-10-06 18:43

**Date reviewed:** 2014-10-21 07:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

No comments.



**BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC**

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
 Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243  
 E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

**ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Meta-Analysis  
**ESPS manuscript NO:** 14420  
**Title:** The fate of meta-analyses: the case of Helicobacter pylori  
**Reviewer code:** 02467561  
**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong  
**Date sent for review:** 2014-10-06 18:43  
**Date reviewed:** 2014-10-21 17:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

**GENERAL COMMENTS:** The manuscript “The fate of meta-analyses: the case of Helicobacter pylori” is very interesting and original in its contents. Nevertheless, in my opinion, it shows some critical points to be addressed reported as follows. **SPECIFIC COMMENTS:** **MAJOR REVISIONS ?**  
**Introduction** o Only the general objective of the study is reported. The specific objectives should also be specified. ? **Historical background** o The Author states: “For reasons unknown to the author, there are no mega-trials on H. pylori including thousands of patients as in the case of hypertension, diabetes or hyperlipidemia treatment: this assessing the heterogeneity of the included studies and then selection of adequate statistical methods are of pivotal importance”. I don’t understand what this paragraph is trying to say. I think I can infer what the Author means, but it would be better if this paragraph was more clearly written. ? **The fate of meta-analyses in Helicobacter pylori research** o In my view, this section is likely to sound piecemeal and it could be better organized by not mixing methods, results and conclusions, but bringing them in separate paragraphs of the same section. Moreover, methods should be described in more detail (number of meta-analyses on selected topics, topic of meta-analyses on Helicobacter pylori, core journals publishing meta-analyses and systematic reviews on Helicobacter pylori). Finally, it should be explained what is meant by “core journals”. ? **Inclusion of meta-analyses in the consensus statements** o The comments above also apply to this section. It could be better organized and written. **MINOR REVISIONS ?** Author contribution “ana “ is misspelled (and the manuscript’s



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

pages should be numbered). ? Introduction “accesed” and “overreview” are misspelled. ? Historical background “acesible” is misspelled. On line 20, the comma after “It became clear” should be removed. On line 23, a dot should be inserted after “...publication bias, etc)”. ? The fate of meta-analyses in Helicobacter pylori research On line 23, after “gastrointestinal diseases” the space before the dot should be deleted. Which is the number of meta-analyses on Helicobacter pylori found (351 or 352?). Please, check and correct. I would suggest the Author to carefully read back the paper in order to correct the above mentioned and other misprints throughout the text.