



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

ESPS manuscript NO: 15035

Title: Effectiveness of adding hip exercises to traditional therapy for treating patellofemoral pain syndrome: a meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 03067328

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-11-05 17:34

Date reviewed: 2015-01-09 04:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comment to the authors: ? This is a good research study on a clinically relevant issue. The study was done systematically and the appropriate steps were followed. ? The manuscript, while readable to persons with content expertise, lacks intrigue. Improvement should be made to the introduction so that the common reader can understand the limitations of traditional physical therapy in treating persons with PFPS. Specific comments: Abstract 1. Please list out all 8 databases searched, or remove the 3 examples. There is no justification of listing only the three and not the others. Introduction 1. Please be a little more specific about the example of the biomechanical factors related to PFPS. Why and how do Q angle and trochlear groove relate to PFPS? 2. It may be important to discuss the current standard physical therapy treatment for PFPS and its efficacy in the introduction. Results 1. It may be more appropriate to specify the type of hip exercises (general or posterolateral) in the methods. Also, what specifically does "general hip exercise" imply? 2. In table 1, it will be helpful to include the number of men and women in the 5 studies that have a mixture of subjects' genders. Discussion 1. "...persons diagnosed with patellofemoral pain syndrome." 2. It is good that the



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

authors recognize the publication bias that is common in the clinical research world. However, the selected research studies in this study are most likely still biased, and the procedure used in this meta-analysis didn't seem to be able to account for it. This limitation should be stated more strongly. 3. The discussion that the non-specific nature of the exercises performed as a limitation is contradictory to the inclusion criterion #4 of this analysis (i.e. study included a list of specific exercises performed). Please explain. 4. In addition to the duration and frequency of the exercises, it is important to consider the intensity of the strengthening exercise. Is it possible to use the prescribed differences in exercise intensity as a predictor of outcome effect sizes? 5. "...in reducing pain and improving function..." 6. Another possible limitation is whether or not the therapy providers, assessors, and patients were blinded. Also whether or not the control and the treatment groups received equal amount of treatment.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

ESPS manuscript NO: 15035

Title: Effectiveness of adding hip exercises to traditional therapy for treating patellofemoral pain syndrome: a meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 02444698

Reviewer's country: Bangladesh

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-11-05 17:34

Date reviewed: 2015-01-09 13:54

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Appreciate author for conducting valuable research in relation to management of patellofemoral pain syndrome.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Meta-Analysis

ESPS manuscript NO: 15035

Title: Effectiveness of adding hip exercises to traditional therapy for treating patellofemoral pain syndrome: a meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 02709880

Reviewer's country: Netherlands

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-11-05 17:34

Date reviewed: 2015-01-09 20:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting subject: treatment of PFPS. The authors present a well written manuscript with a sound conclusion. However, I have a few comments: 1. The authors should specify the term "traditional physical therapy" for PFPS. 2. The follow-up time of the studies included in the review should be documented, at least should be referred to and accounted for. For example the study of Fukuda 2012 showed a different outcome after 1 year compared to their short term followup. Some typo's: Table 1: Fukuda instead of Fukada Fig 2: Witvrouw instead of Witrovouw