

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 1862

Title: Green tea and the risk of gastric cancer: a systematic, comprehensive

Reviewer code: 00183459

Science editor: x.z.huang@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-01-11 11:33

Date reviewed: 2013-02-22 19:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

This is a study aimed at assessing whether the consumption of green tea may have a protective role on the occurrence of gastric cancer. The manuscript is well written but there are some points needing to be clarified better.

1. At the moment, the main risk factor for gastric cancer is *H. pylori* infection. Therefore, the manuscript should be more focused on the interaction between *H. pylori* and green tea as well as the other known risk factors
2. Multivariate analysis on the effect of *H. pylori*, infection sustained by CagA-positive strains, other risk factors and green tea consumption is the only way to demonstrate or exclude the association. Based on those observations I would recommend to reject this manuscript with the possibility of resubmission after those issues have been fully addressed

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 1862

Title: Green tea and the risk of gastric cancer: a systematic, comprehensive

Reviewer code: 00058744

Science editor: x.z.huang@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-01-11 11:33

Date reviewed: 2013-02-24 18:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[Y] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[] Grade B (Very good)	[] Grade B: minor language polishing	[] Existed	[] High priority for publication
[] Grade C (Good)	[] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[] No records	[] Rejection
[] Grade D (Fair)	[] Grade D: rejected	[] Existed	[] Minor revision
[] Grade E (Poor)		[] No records	[] Major revision

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

This is meta-analysis study about the effect of green tea against gastric cancer. The authors analyzed final 17 studies and they concluded that the data about the effect of green tea to gastric cancer prevention was insufficient for definite conclusion.

English was well written. The meta-analysis structure was well established. And the conclusion was reasonable.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 1862

Title: Green tea and the risk of gastric cancer: a systematic, comprehensive

Reviewer code: 00058448

Science editor: x.z.huang@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-01-11 11:33

Date reviewed: 2013-03-05 16:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

Dear Editor, This is an interesting article regarding risk of gastric cancer and green tea consumption. The authors provides detailed literature regarding this issue.