

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 2534

Title: Hepatocellular carcinoma and food contamination: Could ochratoxin A be a great prompter?

Reviewer code: 00502973

Science editor: x.z.huang@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-02-27 16:41

Date reviewed: 2013-03-09 17:29

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|--|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor) | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision |

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

This is a comment to the new online published paper by Ibrahim et al, and is important to the readers to better understand this publication. However, the presentation and readability of this manuscript is not qualified to be presented to the international readers. In specific, (1) There are too many grammatical mistakes in this manuscript. In addition, several sentences are difficult to understand, e.g. "In serum samples of subjects diagnosed with HCC was found high concentrations of OTA, even 5-fold higher, when compared with control group and demonstrating strength association between OTA and HCC, in order that HCC is 9.8 times as frequent in the exposed group to OTA." Such examples include "HCC accounts for 70-90% of primary liver cancers and it is the third leading cause of cancer-related deaths worldwide (10-12), which hepatitis B and C virus infections and intakes of alcohol widely recognized as the major etiological factors of it(13,14).", "After having shown that OTA level was increased significantly among HCC patients, the study demonstrated that OTA and HCC was highly correlated, which HCC is 9.8 times as frequent in the exposed group to OTA", etc. I suggested that the author had better to split such sentences into several short sentences so as to make it easy to read and being understood. The author use "the strength association between OTA and HCC", I prefer to write "OTA was correlated with the onset of HCC". The language needs to be carefully revised and polished. (2) Aflatoxin has long been suggested as an etiology of HCC, and it is also a mold-produced toxin. It should be mentioned in this comment to the report that Ochratoxin A was suggested as an cause of HCC. (3) In the 6th paragraph, the author wrote "To prove that, the researchers compared a HCC group, diagnosed with cancer,...". HCC patients must be diagnosed



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

with cancer. This is a duplicate statement. (4) Also in the 6th paragraph, "After having shown that OTA level was increased significantly among HCC patients, the study demonstrated that OTA and HCC was highly correlated, which HCC is 9.8 times as frequent in the exposed group to OTA." This statement is not clear and inaccurate. This manuscript should be improved before being accepted for publication.