

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 1497

Title: 14-3-3 σ interacting with KCMF1 protein suppresses proliferation and colony formation of human colon cancer stem cells

Reviewer code: 00553892

Science editor: h.h.zhai@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2012-12-17 17:31

Date reviewed: 2013-01-09 08:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

The authors examined proteins interacting with 14-3-3 σ protein and identified some proteins, including KCMF1, NQO2, and HIBADH. The knockdown of 14-3-3 σ and KCMF1 expression could lead to inhibition of cell proliferation and colony formation of SW1116csc. Therefore, they concluded that KCMF1 interacting with 14-3-3 σ might be involved in the proliferation and colony formation of human colon cancer stem cells.

Criticisms:

1. The conclusion described in Page 2 "Some proteins interacting with 14-3-3 σ protein may inhibit the proliferation and colony formation of human colon cancer stem cells." is wrong.
2. It is very important to demonstrate how SW1116csc cells were isolated and evidences of their cancer stem cell properties, such as sphere formation, in vivo tumorigenicity and expression of stemness genes.
3. Though they emphasize the role of KCMF1 and 14-3-3 σ in cancer stem cells, it seems overstatement since they didn't show (1) whether expression of KCMF1 and interaction with 14-3-3 σ are observed in non-cancer stem cells or not, and (2) whether their findings are characteristic of cancer stem cells.
4. In the knockdown experiments, negative control siRNA should be used.
5. They examined colony formation in soft agar containing 10% FCS in order to assess sphere formation capacity. However, it can't reflect the self-renewal capacity of stem cells. They should use standard sphere formation assay as shown in many references.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

-
6. The result section contains redundant methodological issues and there are few legends for figures. The authors should describe results and legends precisely.
 7. They should discuss the molecular function of KCMF1 and 14-3-3 σ and why it was required to knockdown both of them to fully suppress the proliferation.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 1497

Title: 14-3-3 σ interacting with KCMF1 protein suppresses proliferation and colony formation of human colon cancer stem cells

Reviewer code: 00183504

Science editor: h.h.zhai@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2012-12-17 17:31

Date reviewed: 2013-01-13 10:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

The paper presents an original work about colon cancer stem cells, and shows an original pathway for colon cancer management. Although this, some changes should be made:

Major changes:

- In the Material and Methods, some sections describing methods should be deleted.
- Authors should explain more carefully why they select (apart from that it is the more remarkable on the results) KCMF1 in the subsequent analysis.
- Data were not shown for the positive yeast two-hybrid interactions between 14-3-3s and the candidates.

Minor changes:

- Figure legends are not standard and without enough information.
- Some English grammar mistakes need to be corrected.