

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 2224

Title: Mitochondrial ATP 6 and 8 Polymorphisms in Irritable Bowel Syndrome with Diarrhea

Reviewer code: 02451071

Science editor: j.l.wang@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-02-09 15:42

Date reviewed: 2013-02-16 10:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

In the short paper, Wang et al. analyzed the polymorphisms of mitochondrial ATP (MT-ATP) 6 and 8 genes in the colon and ileum of IBS with diarrhea (IBS-D). Based on clinical samples, they concluded that patients with IBS-D have a higher incidence of MT-ATP 6 and 8 polymorphisms, compared with healthy controls. This finding is interesting and will be helpful for clinician to emphasize the importance of the mtDNA polymorphism of IBS-D patients.

Overall, the methodology is appropriate and writing is good, however, I noticed that further minor language polishing is needed. In addition, for the first abbreviation in any section should be accompanied with full name, such as IBS in Abstract.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 2224

Title: Mitochondrial ATP 6 and 8 Polymorphisms in Irritable Bowel Syndrome with Diarrhea

Reviewer code: 00002838

Science editor: j.l.wang@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-02-09 15:42

Date reviewed: 2013-02-19 23:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

The authors evaluate the polymorphisms in the mitochondrial genes encoding for the ATP synthase (MT-ATP6 and MT-ATP8) from the mitochondrial respiratory chain complex genes and they detected the polymorphic sites, and the two most common polymorphisms in these two genes in a control group and in a IBS-D group of patients, the main difference found comparing these two groups was a median of 2 polymorphic sites and a median of 3 for the IBS-D group.

Main comments:

The main criticism is that differences between the control group and patients found are very mild, moreover the polymorphisms found are different in the vast majority of the cases, and only 3 IBS-D patients presented the same combination of polymorphisms. Moreover the authors were not able to correlate these changes to the clinical profile or to establish any further correlation or the role that these polymorphisms could play in IBS-D. Did the authors check the clinical history prior to the year before the study to discard patients with prolonged episodes of abdominal pain or erratic bowel habits? How did the authors standardize the biopsies collection? It should be specified or better explained that biopsies were obtained from the muscosal layer. In the results section the authors claim that they found differences in the percentage of missense polymorphisms between groups, but they do not provide the data, percentage or indicate in which group was found the higher percentage of those polymorphisms. In the discussion the authors state that the coincidence in small and large intestine of mtDNA changes is suggestive of similar pathogenesis in both locations, in my opinion is too speculative as no relationship between pathogenesis and mitochondrial respiratory chain



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

complex genes polymorphisms has been established. In the same sense this could be a spurious finding and this should be discussed as well. Minor comments: Abstract: In the methods section of the abstract unify criteria twenty-eight or 28 Specify which kind of biopsies were taken (Mucosal biopsies) Introduction: Second paragraph Camilerry should be replaced by Camilleri Materials and Methods: Page 5 line two I suggest to rephrase “who had not presented...” Discussion: In page 9 paragraph we chose should be replaced by we have chosen.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 2224

Title: Mitochondrial ATP 6 and 8 Polymorphisms in Irritable Bowel Syndrome with Diarrhea

Reviewer code: 02450799

Science editor: j.l.wang@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-02-09 15:42

Date reviewed: 2013-02-26 00:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

This is a well-written scientific report describing mitochondrial ATP 6 and 8 polymorphisms in patients with irritable bowen syndrome (IBS). IBS is the most prevalent gastrointestinal disorder with unknown mechanism of pathogenesis. The presented results are based on appropriate methods. Conclusion and discussion sections are appropriate. The authors stated that tissue-specific samples are more appropriate for anlysing mtDNA polymorphisms (vs. blood samples). While the reviewer agreed with this statement, the comparison of results from colon-ileal tissues vs. blood will be very encouraging.