ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 2225

Title: The relationship between HCC and different HBV genotypes with spontaneous YMDD mutation

Reviewer code: 02439544

Science editor: j.l.wang@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-02-10 20:04

Date reviewed: 2013-02-23 23:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of	[ ] No records	publication
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

1.This is a case control study. Ideally the case and control group should have the same characteristics except the risk factor(s) under investigation, i.e. genotype and YMDD mutation is this study. The rate of spontaneous YMDD mutation may increase with disease duration or viral replication activity. HCC occurs mostly in patients with liver cirrhosis or chronic hepatitis B. The case and control group should at least have similar characteristics in age, HBV viral load, and hepatitis status (HBV carrier, chronic hepatitis B, liver cirrhosis), otherwise the statistical analysis would be biased.

2. Liver cirrhosis is the a strong risk factor for HCC and should be included in Unconditional logistic regression analyses.

3. The 95%CI of genotype C virus with spontaneous YMDD mutation is 1.844-78.576. The range is too wide to be correct.

4. The language needs polishing. For example: a. The word "Infector" implies person who spread the disease.   The phrase, "chronic HBV infectors", is rarely used, and can be replaced with "chronic HBV infection" or "patients with chronic HBV infection". b. Unconditional logistic regression analysis suggest (suggests) c. Chronic infection of HBV, the major reason (cause) of hepatocellular cancer (HCC) in our country d. liver diseases caused by fatty or self immunology (fatty liver or autoimmunity) e. Empty stomach (Fasting) venous blood

5. Discussion section can be more concise by removing repetition of the results.